

CATALOG DEPARTMENT

כותרות נושאים בעברית. פותח ע"י: המחלקה למיון ולקטלוג עברי, הספרייה המרכזית ע"ש וורצוויילר, אוניברסיטת בר-אילן; שלמה רוטנגרג, שפּרה ליבמן, גיטה הופמן, שרה שחם, דוד וילק. רמת-גן, סיון תשנ"ב (יוני 1992)

Hebrew Subject Headings. Developed by the Hebrew Classification and Cataloging Department, Wurzweiler Central Library, Bar-Ilan University: Shlomo Rotenberg, Shifra Liebman, Gita Hoffman, Sara Shacham, David Wilk. Ramat Gan: June 1992. 2 vols. (798; 435 pp.) \$400.

Reviewed by:

Bella Hass Weinberg
St. John's University and YIVO
New York City

Context

Under the rubric of multiculturalism, the assumption that everyone speaks or should speak English has been challenged over the past few decades, and it has been recognized that information must be provided in other languages. Credit for bilingual services in the U.S. is due to the prominent Jewish sociolinguist, Joshua A. Fishman (1976), whose ideas influenced governmental and educational policies and, ultimately, libraries.

One of the ways in which American librarians are meeting the needs of diverse cultures is through the provision of subject access in languages other than English. Canada is officially bilingual (French and English), and its national library provides bilingual cataloging data. The first list of French subject headings, translated from Library of Congress Subject Headings, was produced in Canada more than three decades ago at Université Laval (*Répertoire*, 1962). Fournier (1978) documents the history of this list and its adoption by the National Library of Canada. In the U.S., a Spanish-English subject heading list has been published within the past decade (Bilindex, 1984). Databases (i.e., machine-readable indexes) for Spanish-speaking Americans have been described by Rodriguez (1990).

In Israel, bilingual subject access has been available for a long time through indexes to a classified catalog (Hovne, 1970). Gita Hoffman presented the rationale for He-

brew subject headings at the First International Conference of Judaica and Israeli Librarians in July 1990 and subsequently submitted her paper to *Judaica Librarianship* (Hoffman *et al.*, 1992). The work under review is the first published edition of the Hebrew subject headings created at Bar-Ilan University, which are assigned to books in Hebrew script—on general as well as Judaic and Israeli topics.

Description

The first volume lists the Hebrew subject headings with their English equivalents (see sample page in Figure 1). A one-page introduction in Hebrew explains the rationale for Hebrew subject headings and the inadequacies of Library of Congress subject headings (LCSH) for Judaica, and identifies the major topics (e.g., Hasidism) for which original Hebrew subject headings have been developed at Bar-Ilan.

The instructions for use, also in Hebrew, explain the structure of entries, in particular, the cross-reference terminology and the filing arrangement (more on these below). Authorities for Hebrew spelling (the method chosen is *ketiv ḥaser*—the classic defective spelling) and proper names are identified. This is followed by a page containing abbreviations and full forms for sources of personal and place names in the Roman alphabet. (The lack of numbering of these pages makes it difficult for a reviewer to provide precise references in citing passages from the introductory matter.)

These few preliminary leaves are followed by 798 pages, with two columns each, of Hebrew subject headings with their English equivalents, as well as *see* and *see also* references in Hebrew. There are scope notes for some headings, e.g., **Economics—Israel**, we are told, is to be assigned to works about the *discipline* in the State of Israel. For the economics of Israel, we are referred to the heading **Israel—Economic conditions**.

The list is not limited to topical headings. It includes: many personal names, citing the National Union Catalog or the LC Name Authority File as the source for the Roman equivalent; geographic names, citing the *Columbia Lippincott Gazetteer* or specialized sources for "Jewish geography"; and even uniform titles, e.g., "Memorial book for the community of Kutno."

For many headings, the list includes standard subdivisions, e.g., **Katz, Jacob—1904—Bibliography**, as well as geographic subdivisions, e.g., **Yiddish literature—Romania**, which largely accounts for the size of the book. As the introduction states, the list is based on headings actually assigned to works cataloged at Bar-Ilan since 1984; thus, many other combinations of headings and sub-headings are possible.

Volume II, entitled *English-Hebrew Index*, has an introduction in English that is not a

ציור המשפחה הקינטית (מבחן) ראה: מבחן ציור המשפחה הקינטית	ראה גם: ציונות סוציאליסטית ראה גם: ציונות רוזינויסטית ראה גם: עם ישראל, זקה לארץ ישראל
ציור ישראלי	ציונות - ארגנטינה
Painting, Israeli	Zionism - Argentina
ציור מודרני - המאה ה-20 - ישראל	הציונות והשוואה
Painting, Modern - 20th century - Israel	Zionism and the Holocaust ~
ציור צרפתי - תערוכות	ראה גם: מנהיגות יהודית - ישראל - יחס לשואה ראה גם: שואה ראה גם: תנועות נער ציוניות בשואה נראה מ: השואה והציונות
Painting, French - Exhibitions	הציונות והשוואה - ארה"ב
ציורי ילדים - ישראל - תערוכות	Zionism and the Holocaust - United States
Children's drawings - Israel - Exhibitions	ציונות - לבנון
ציורי עלילה	ציונות - לוב
Narrative painting	ציונות - מאמרים
נראה מ: ציורים ספוריים	הערה: מאמרים של מחבר אחד, או של כמה מחברים; מאמרים בנושא מוגדר יותר ראה לפי הנושא
ציורי עלילה איטלקיים	Zionism - Essays ~
Narrative painting, Italian	ראה גם: יהדות - מאמרים
ציורים ספוריים - ראה: ציורי עלילה	ציונות - מצרים
Cytochemistry	Zionism - Egypt
ציפמן, שלמה	ציונות - פילוסופיה - למוד והוראה
Tsipman, Shelomoh	Zionism - Philosophy - Study and teaching
הערה: הלועזית: לא נמצא מקור	ציונות - צ'כוסלובקיה
ציקלופרופין	Zionism - Czechoslovakia
ראה: תרכובות אליציקליות	ציונות - צרפת - היסטוריה
צ'כוב, אנטון פבלוביץ	Zionism - France - History
הערה: האנגלית: LC NAF	ציונות רוזינויסטית - רומניה
הערה: העברית: הספרייה הלאומית (במחשב)	Revisionist Zionism - Romania
Chekhov, Anton Pavlovich, 1860-1904	ציונים דתיים
נראה מ: צ'כוב, אנטון פבלוביץ	ראה גם: דתיים ראה גם: דתיים מודרניים ראה גם: ציונות דתית ראה גם: ציונים נראה מ: דתיים לאומיים נראה מ: דתיים ציוניים
צ'כוב, אנטון פבלוביץ - השפעה - בר יוסף	ציונים דתיים - ישראל
Chekhov, Anton Pavlovich, 1860-1904 - Influence - Bar-Yosef	ציוניסון, ש ראה: בן ציון, שמחה
צלום - ישראל - תערוכות	ציור איטלקי - היסטוריה
Photography - Israel - Exhibitions	ציור אסלאמי - תערוכות
צלנים וצלינות מוסלמים - המזרח התיכון	Painting, Islamic - Exhibitions
Muslim pilgrims and pilgrimages - Middle East	
צלף קוצני - למוד והוראה (יסודי)	
Capparis spinosa - Study and teaching (Elementary)	
צלקה, דן	
הערה: הלועזית: LC NAF	
Tsalka, Dan, 1936-	
צלקה, דן: אלף לבבות	
Tsalka, Dan, 1936- . Elef levavot	
צלקה, דן: כפפות	
Tsalka, Dan, 1936- . Kefafot	

Figure 1. Sample page from *Hebrew Subject Headings*, courtesy of Bar-Ilan University. (This is not an actual page from the edition reviewed, but the format is identical.)

precise translation of the Hebrew one. The English version provides less detail on the areas for which original Hebrew headings have been developed, but includes an important statistic that is lacking in the introduction to the first volume: the Bar-Ilan database contains over 20,000 subject headings. Presumably, this number includes heading-subheading combinations such as those illustrated above.

The English user guide contains somewhat less information than the Hebrew one. The Hebrew cross-reference structure is not illustrated in the English guide, probably because no such references are included in volume II—only the Hebrew equivalents of English terms. The Hebrew instructions for the user also give the date of *Library of Congress Subject Headings* that was consulted for the English equivalents—1991. The number of the edition is not identified (the 14th would match the date), but we are told that microfiche updates were consulted as well.

The list of authorities for proper names is repeated in volume II, with bibliographic data for the few Hebrew authorities in Romanization or translation. The body of this volume contains Library of Congress subject headings and translations of Bar-Ilan Hebrew subject headings in a single A-Z sequence, with headings in the latter category identified by a tilde (~). A sample page is in Figure 2.

As a result of the filing principle noted in the instructions for use, i.e., that all punctuation is ignored, the arrangement of headings is very different from that which one finds in LC products. The sequence

Israel—Maps
Israel Meir, ha-Kohen
Israel—Military Policy

serves to illustrate the absence of the field-subfield principle (Hines & Harris, 1966, p. 12–13).

Subdivisions relating to Kafka in general are filed between titles of his works:

Kafka, Franz, 1883–1924. Metamorphosis
Kafka, Franz, 1883–1924—Study and teaching (Secondary)
Kafka, Franz, 1883–1924. The castle

We may also note the inability of the computer program used to produce this list to

ignore initial articles of subfields (one would expect *The castle* to file before *Metamorphosis*). Even the *ALA Filing Rules* (1980), which call for ignoring punctuation, specify that initial articles of titles in name-title entries are to be ignored (p. 24).

The lack of sophistication in the computer sorting routine is also evident in the handling of the hyphen, e.g., **Ha-Kefar Ha-Hashmona'i** (vol. II, p. 127) files before **Haan, Jacob Israel de**, far from its expected position before **Hakham, Simon** (p. 129), with no secondary access under **Kefar** (p. 228), where there is a long list of place names without the initial definite article.

Uses of the Work

The compilers have envisioned the utility of this list to other libraries that desire to provide subject access in Hebrew to their user communities. One would expect the vast majority of such libraries to be located in Israel; hence, at first glance, American and European Judaica librarians might consider this work irrelevant to their collections.

Yet *Hebrew Subject Headings* has many potential applications in libraries with no plans to provide Hebrew subject access. First, as Hoffman *et al.* (1992) have pointed out, Judaica librarians working with LCSH, who often cannot find appropriately specific headings for the works they need to catalog, may find the Bar-Ilan list helpful in amplifying LCSH. Second, those who consider certain LC headings for Jewish topics theologically or otherwise objectionable may find models for revising them in the Bar-Ilan list.

The publication can be helpful to descriptive catalogers, as well as to subject catalogers. Because it includes the names of many authors with the corresponding Roman form taken from the LC Name Authority File, *Hebrew Subject Headings* can be a wonderful aid in the cataloging of Hebrew literature. (In this regard, it complements the Yiddish Authority File of the YIVO Library (1990), which provides direct references from the Yiddish form of an author's name to the LC heading, where available, and to other Romanized forms found in the author's works.)

There is interest among American Judaica librarians in standardizing parallel Hebrew access points on RLIN (the Research Li-

braries Information Network), i.e., not simply copying the Hebrew form of a name on a title page, but using a single form consistently in all records for one author (Aliprand, 1990, p. 18). The Bar-Ilan compilation provides uniform headings for Hebrew authors, which may save on local authority work.

The publication is also potentially useful outside the catalog department. *Hebrew Subject Headings* is a rich source of modern Israeli terminology, and may be viewed as a specialized dictionary of modern Hebrew. The choice of terms sometimes reflects Bar-Ilan's political viewpoint, e.g., the heading **Judea, Samaria and Gaza** (as opposed to LC's **West Bank**), and the compilation lends itself to analyses of this type.

Besides its utility as a linguistic reference work, *Hebrew Subject Headings* has bibliographic relevance. For example, a heading such as **Judaism—Liturgical Objects—Afghanistan** implies that a work on this subject has been cataloged at Bar-Ilan within the past eight years. Bar-Ilan's reference librarians may find themselves inundated with inquiries from those who acquire this compilation, regarding the publications to which the headings have been assigned.

Recommendations

From Ya'akov Aronson, Bar-Ilan's University Librarian, I learned that new editions of the work are to be issued on demand, since it is essentially a printout of a database that is growing continually. Following are several recommendations for enhancing the form and structure of the work:

1. Improve bibliographic identification: While *Hebrew Subject Headings* is a cataloger's aid, the publication itself is hard to catalog. Volume I has only a Hebrew title page, and Volume II, only an English one. The Hebrew and English titles are reproduced, respectively, on the covers and spines. The Library of Congress, as expected, selected the Hebrew title, *Kotrot nos'im be-ivrit* as the title proper for the set (see Figure 3, Field 245), but not as title main entry. The work received corporate main entry (Figure 3, Field 110), implying that the list reflects the collective thinking of Bar-Ilan catalogers, or that it is a work of an administrative nature, recording one library's practices. In any case, it is recommended that Hebrew and English title

Breuer, Isaac, 1883-1946	ברויאר, יצחק	Buchner, Ze'ev Wolf ben David, ha-Kohen, 1750-1820 - Criticism and interpretation	בוכנר, זאב וולף בן דוד - בקרת ופרשנות
Breuer, Mordechai, 1921-	ברויאר, מרדכי בן שמשון	Buchner, Ze'ev Wolf ben David, ha-Kohen, 1750-1820. Keter malkhut	בוכנר, זאב וולף בן דוד: כתר מלכות
Breuer, Salomon, 1850-1926	ברויאר, שלמה זלמן	Buchner, Ze'ev Wolf ben David, ha-Kohen, 1750-1820. Tsahut ha-melitsah	בוכנר, זאב וולף בן דוד: צחות המליצה
Bribery	שחד	Building - Rome	בניה - רומי
Bridegroom	חתן	Bulimia - Fiction	בולימיה - ספרת
Brod, Max, 1884-1968	ברוד, מקס	Burgenland (Austria)	בורגנלנד (אוסטריה)
Broderson, Moses, 1890-1956	ברודרזון, משה	Burla, Yehuda, 1886-1969	בורלא, יהודה
Brodsky, Joseph, 1940-	ברודסקי, יוסף	Burla, Yehuda, 1886-1969 - Criticism and interpretation	בורלא, יהודה - בקרת ופרשנות
Brodsky, Joseph, 1940- - Biography	ברודסקי, יוסף - ביוגרפיה	Bus lines	קוי אוטובוסים
Brodsky, Joseph, 1940- - Criticism and interpretation	ברודסקי, יוסף - בקרת ופרשנות	Bus lines - Tel Aviv Region - Maps	קוי אוטובוסים - תל אביב (אזור) - מפות
Broide, Israel	ברוידא, ישראל	Bus terminals	מסופי אוטובוסים
Broide, Zvi, 1951-1973	ברוידא, צבי	Bus terminals - Tel Aviv	מסופי אוטובוסים - תל אביב
Brokers (Jewish law)	מתוכים - הלכה	Bushire (Iran)	אבושהר (אירן)
Bronte, Emily, 1818-1848	ברונטה, אמילי	Business ethics - Study and teaching (Higher)	אתיקה בעסקים - למוד והוראה (גבוה)
Bronte, Emily, 1818-1848. Wuthering heights	ברונטה, אמילי: אנקת גבהים	Business failures - Prevention	עסקים, כשלונות - מניעה
Brothers and sisters	אחים ואחיות	Cabala	קבלה
Brothers and sisters - Attitudes	אחים ואחיות - עמדות	Cabala - Dictionaries	קבלה - מלונים
Brothers and sisters - Israel - Family relationships	אחים ואחיות - ישראל - יחסים במשפחה	Cabala - France - Provence-Alpes-Cote d'Azur	קבלה - צרפת - פרובנס
Brownstone, Ezekiel A M , 1897-	ברונשטיין, יחזקאל	Cabala - History	קבלה - היסטוריה
Brownstone, Ezekiel A M , 1897- - Bibliography	ברונשטיין, יחזקאל - ביבליוגרפיה	Cabala - History and criticism	קבלה - היסטוריה ובקרת
Brum, Mordekhai	ברום, מרדכי	Cabala - Manuscripts	קבלה - כתבי יד
Bruno, Giordano, 1548-1600	ברונו, ג'ורדנו	Cabala - 1500-1660 - History and criticism	קבלה - 1500-1660 - היסטוריה ובקרת
Brzozow (Poland)	ברז'וב (פולין)	Cable television - Social aspects - Israel	טלוויזיה בכבלים - הבטים חברתיים - ישראל
Bucharest (Romania)	בוקרסט (רומניה)	Cain (Biblical figure)	קין (אישיות תנכית)
Buchner, Ze'ev Wolf ben David, ha-Kohen, 1750-1820	בוכנר, זאב וולף בן דוד		

Figure 2. Sample page from the English-Hebrew Index. (Not an actual page from the edition reviewed, but the format is identical.)

pages be provided in future editions of both volumes. Assignment of an ISSN (International Standard Serial Number) would also help librarians to locate bibliographic records for the work. [An ISSN is found in the volume of additions and changes received after this review was completed. See box at end of this review.]

In the edition under review, the scope of each volume is indicated through section title pages, e.g., Volume II: *English-Hebrew Index*, which follow several leaves of preliminaries. The scope of each volume should be indicated on the title page—from which a cataloger might derive contents notes—and if space permits, on the spine as well.

2. Provide equivalent introductions: It has been noted above that the preliminaries in Volumes I and II are not exact translations of each other; the introductory matter should be completely bilingual. Israeli librarians learn English at an early age, but are more comfortable reading technical descriptions in Hebrew. Conversely, Judaica librarians in other countries can generally work with the Hebrew alphabet and read texts in the language to varying degrees, but most are more comfortable with library science terminology in English.

3. Add explanations of scope: The introductions need to be amplified as well to explain the true scope of the compilation. For example, it is unlikely that the three columns of uniform titles beginning with the phrase "Memorial book for the community of . . ." are subject headings; few *yisker-bikher* (memorial books) have critical works written about them. I suspect that the list includes headings established for descriptive cataloging, as well as subject cataloging. If so, this is commendable, as LC (1989) has grappled with the borderline between headings to be established by descriptive catalogers and those to be handled by subject catalogers. If the scope of the work is Hebrew subject and descriptive headings, however, the work should be renamed.

4. Correct thesaurus terminology: Volume I is entitled "*Thesaurus*" (in Hebrew). This is a misnomer in the information science sense of the term (as opposed to the general meaning of the term, "treasury of words"), for several reasons:

(a) Thesauri are lists of descriptors representing single concepts that are designed

for postcoordination (NISO, 1991), i.e., combination of terms at the time of searching a computerized catalog or index. The terms in *Hebrew Subject Headings*, like LC subject headings, are most definitely pre-coordinate, containing complex combinations such as **Sewage disposal in the ground—Sharon Region and Computers and children.**

The compilers clearly recognize the power of keyword searching, and under a number of Hebrew headings there is a note similar to that under **Yehude . . .** (Jews of): "See also as part of a subheading combined with a heading. All occurrences can be retrieved by using the FIND command" (Vol. I, p. 267—*free translation*).

(b) The list does not employ standard thesaurus notation, i.e., the codes U, UF, BT, NT, and RT (Use, Used For, Broader Term, Narrower Term, and Related Term, respectively). Mary Dykstra (1988), in her article, "LC Subject Headings Disguised as a Thesaurus," criticized LC for adopting thesaurus notation for a list of pre-coordinate terms. *Hebrew Subject Headings* retains the traditional *see* and *see also* references in addition to pre-coordinated terms, so it falls short of being a true thesaurus.

The establishment of rigorous semantic relationships between terms and the consistent tracing of references are two of the hallmarks of thesauri. *Hebrew Subject Headings* meets these criteria only for the equivalence relationship, i.e., synonymy. There are numerous *see* references in the list, and their reciprocals are traced (in Hebrew) as *seen from*. These may readily be translated into *use* and *used for* references, respectively.

In the case of *see also* references, *Hebrew Subject Headings* provides less structure than the editions of LCSH preceding the adoption of thesaurus notation. While the single command *see also* in LCSH had two functions—referring (a) from broad to narrow terms and (b) to related terms—these could be differentiated through the *xx* (see also from) tracings. Narrower terms generally featured an *xx* tracing from, but not a *see also* reference to a broader heading, while related terms on the same level had both *see also* references and *xx* tracings.

Hebrew Subject Headings includes no reciprocals of *see also* references. The ref-

erence is always made in both directions, even for broader term-narrower term relationships. For example, there is a *see also* reference from the Hebrew term for **Yom Kippur** to the more general heading **High Holy Days**, in addition to a *see also* in the other direction.

From a user perspective, the inclusion of such references as **Bride (Jewish law)** *see also* **Jewish law** is a waste of space. An *xx* tracing would have been equally space-consuming but more correct from a cataloger's perspective. There are also unnecessary references in the list between mutually exclusive sibling terms (headings on the same level), e.g., **Bride (Jewish law)** *see also* **Bridegroom (Jewish law)**, in addition to the appropriate links from these terms to the Hebrew headings for **Betrothal** and **Weddings**.

I have been told that a limitation of the ALEPH program, which is used to maintain the database, prevented the use of thesaurus notation, but a subject heading list that fails to differentiate the hierarchical (broader term-narrower term) relationship from the associative (related term) one should not be entitled *Thesaurus*.

(c) There are numerous *orphan* headings in the list, i.e., terms with no hierarchical or associative links—in this case, no *see also* references. A true thesaurus allows for the grouping of all descriptors into hierarchies or categories. This cannot be done for *Hebrew Subject Headings*, which is, for the most part, a list of unconnected alphabetic-specific headings, and in a few cases, alphabetic-classed, e.g., **Tefillot** (Prayers), which is subdivided by the names of specific prayers and liturgical rites that might well be sought directly, such as **Sefirat ha-omer** (Counting of the Omer). This group of headings derives "from the list prepared by the cataloging subcommittee of the Standing Committee of the National and University Libraries in Israel" (User Guide, Vol. II). (A number of the headings feature romanizations that differ from the American Library Association/Library of Congress system, e.g., **Qeriat Shema**; the authors have alluded to this inconsistency in the introduction.) Many comments could be made about the uniform titles, e.g., that **Zemiroth** (Sabbath songs) **u-piyutim** (and liturgical poems) should be split into two separate headings, as each concept has different related terms, but such comments do not belong

```

BKS/PROD Books          FUL/BIB  DCLH92-B2243          Catalog          NXYH-LAG
FIN TW HEBREW SUBJECT HEADINGS - Cluster 1 of 3 - HBR
+
ID:DCLH92-B2243          RTYP:c    ST:p      FRN:      MS:      EL:      AD:09-02-92
CC:9114  BLT:am          DCF:a    CSC:      MOD:      SNR:      ATC:      UD:11-03-92
CP:is    L:heb          INT:      GPC:      BIO:      FIC:0    CON:
PC:s     PD:1992/      REP:      CPI:0    FSI:0    ILC:      II:0
MMD:     OR:      POL:      DM:      RR:      COL:      EML:      GEN:      BSE:
010      92827882/HE
040      DLC-R+cDLC-R
041 0    hebeng
043      a-is---
050 00   Z695.Z5+bH48 1992 <Hebr>
110 2    Universi.tat Bar-Ilan.*bMa.hla.kah le-miyun ule-.ki.tlug 'Ivri.
110 2    אוניברסיטת בר-אילן. *מחלקת למינון וסקטור עברי.
245 10   Kotrot no's'im be-'Ivrit /+cputa.h 'a. y. ha-Ma.hla.kah le-miyun ule-.
ki.tlug 'Ivri, ha-Sifriyah ha-merkazit 'a. sh. .Vurts.vailer, Universi.t
at Bar-Ilan, Shelomoh Ro.tenberg ... [et al.].
245 10   כותרות נושאים בעברית /+ספות ע"י המחלקת למינון וסקטור עברי. הספרות הסת
כלית ע"ש ורצוניצר, אוניברסיטת בר-אילן, שלמה רוטנברג ... et al.
260      Ramat-Gan :+bha-Ma.hla.kah,+c[1992]
260      רמת-גן :+מחלקת, +c1992
300      798, 435 p. ;+c28 cm.
500      Hebrew and English.
BKS/PROD Books          FUL/BIB  DCLH92-B2243          Catalog          NXYH-LAG
Cluster 1 of 3 - HBR
HOL
500      Vol. 2 has title: Hebrew subject headings.
650 0    Subject headings, Hebrew.
650 0    Subject headings+xJudaism.
650 0    Judaism+xAbstracting and indexing.
650 0    Subject headings+xJewish literature.
650 0    Jewish literature+xAbstracting and indexing.
650 0    Subject headings+xIsrael.
651 0    Israel+xAbstracting and indexing.
651 4
740 01   Hebrew subject headings.

```

Figure 3. Library of Congress MARC record for *Hebrew Subject Headings*, as displayed on RLIN.

in this review; Bar-Ilan catalogers are merely trying to follow a national authority list.

A useful set of references from alphabeticoclassed headings is found under **Halakhah** (Jewish law), which is subdivided into four categories based on the divisions of the *Shulhan Arukh* (Code of Jewish Law). Thus, instead of the lengthy list of narrower-term references that one finds under the Library of Congress subject heading **Jewish law**, there is a helpful thematic grouping. (*Hebrew Subject Headings* also has some *see also* references

under the simple heading **Halakhah**, but these are for subjects that can relate to more than one part of the *Shulhan Arukh*, e.g., **Refuah** (Medicine) relates to both *Even ha'Ezer* and *Yoreh De'ah*.)

If the database is, in fact, a combined Hebrew name and subject authority file, it will not be possible to place all the headings into hierarchies. Although LC links certain types of proper names to topical subject headings, for personal names as subjects LC's policy is generic posting, e.g., to assign the heading *Authors, Yiddish*, as well as *Sholem Aleichem*, to a

work about that writer. If Bar-Ilan were to link such headings as *Authors, Hebrew* with individual names, that would be very useful. (This is not a simple recommendation for improvement of the published list; the proposed enhancement would involve a great deal of research.)

5. Provide a list of subdivisions: It was noted above that the list includes many heading-subheading combinations. A separate list of the generally applicable subdivisions should be provided at the beginning of each volume (Hebrew-to-English; English-to-Hebrew). The compilers

might consider deleting from the main list combinations such as **Jews, Oriental—Social conditions—Congresses**, despite their bibliographic value, since with time, the size of the printout may become unmanageable as a result of such precoordinates.

6. Improve format of entries: The format of the publication is attractive. Hebrew headings and their English equivalents are printed in boldface type of a generous size. Scope notes and cross-reference commands are in lightface. The headings following the commands *see* and *see also* are boldface; headings within scope notes should also be typographically differentiated from the text of the note. For example, under **'Etikah (Ethics)**, we find, "Note: Ethics in Judaism, see musar" (vol. 1, p. 74—*free translation*). The last word of the note should be boldfaced, especially since Hebrew has no capital letters.

English equivalents of headings generally follow scope notes, and precede *see* and *see also* references, even where the scope note provides the authority for the English heading. The order of notes for sources of Hebrew and Roman headings is not consistent. In the case of the place name **Rokiškis (Lithuania)**, the note for the Roman heading precedes that for the Hebrew one (p. 693); for **Rzeszów (Poland)**, the reverse order is found (p. 687). Notes on sources should be coded differently from scope notes; it would also be logical for the authority for the Roman heading to be positioned after it, rather than after the Hebrew heading.

There are very few errors in the compilation; the assistance of a proofreader is acknowledged in the preface. I noticed only one subheading that was not capitalized, and the misprint "unavailable" in the User Guide.

Conclusion

In sum, *Hebrew Subject Headings* is a carefully constructed cataloger's tool with many potential uses in the reference departments of Judaica research libraries. We look forward to the growth and refinement of the database and will watch with great interest the implementation of Hebrew subject access in libraries other than Bar-Ilan, in addition to the emulation of Bar-Ilan's revised and expanded LC subject headings for Judaica in libraries that continue to provide English subject headings only.

The publication of *Hebrew Subject Headings* constitutes a major achievement in the field of Judaica librarianship, and its compilers are to be congratulated.

References

[ALA] American Library Association. Filing Committee. *ALA Filing Rules*. Chicago: American Library Association, 1980.

Aliprand, Joan M. "Hebrew on RLIN: An Update," *Judaica Librarianship*, vol. 5, no. 1 (Spring 1989–Winter 1990), pp. 12–20.

Bilindex: A Bilingual Spanish-English Subject Heading List: Spanish Equivalents to Library of Congress Subject Headings. Oakland, CA: California Spanish Language Data Base, 1984.

Dykstra, Mary. "LC Subject Headings Disguised as a Thesaurus," *Library Journal*, vol. 113, no. 4 (Mar. 1, 1988), pp. 42–46.

Fishman, Joshua A. *Bilingual Education: An International Sociological Perspective*. Rowley, MA: Newbury House, © 1976.

Fournier, Michel. "Le Répertoire de Vedettes-Matière de la Bibliothèque de l'Université Laval," in: *What's in a Name: Control of Catalogue Records Through Automated Authority Files*, ed. by Natsuko Y. Furuya. (Toronto: University of Toronto Library Automation Systems, 1978), pp. 109–119.

Hines, Theodore C.; Harris, Jessica L. *Computer Filing of Index, Bibliographic, and Catalog Entries*. Newark, NJ: Brodart Foundation, 1966.

Hoffman, Gita *et al.* "Hebrew Subject Headings: Development and Implementation at Bar Ilan University," *Judaica Librarianship*, vol. 6, no. 1–2 (Spring 1991–Winter 1992), pp. 24–32, 37.

Hovne, Clara. "Indexing a Classified Catalog," *Library Resources & Technical Services*, vol. 14, no. 4 (Fall 1970), pp. 546–552.

[LC] "Headings for Certain Entities," *Cataloging Service Bulletin*, no. 43 (Winter 1989), pp. 2–11.

[NISO] National Information Standards Organization. *Proposed American National Standard Guidelines for the Construction, Format, and Management of Monolingual Thesauri*. Bethesda, MD: 1991. (Standard to be published early in 1994.)

Répertoire de Vedettes-Matière de la Bibliothèque de l'Université Laval. (Québec: Presses de l'Université Laval, 1962).

Rodriguez, Ron. "Latino Databases," in: *Latino Librarianship: A Handbook for Professionals*, Salvador Guarena, editor (Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Co., 1990), pp. 58–67.

YIVO Institute for Jewish Research. "The Yiddish Authority File of the YIVO Library," in: *The Yiddish Catalog and Authority File of the YIVO Library*, edited, and with introductions by Zachary M. Baker and Bella Hass Weinberg (Boston, MA: G. K. Hall, 1990), vol. 5, pp. 1–340.

Bella Hass Weinberg has recently been promoted to the rank of Professor in the Division of Library and Information Science at St. John's University. She is also Consulting Librarian of YIVO Institute for Jewish Research. As YIVO's Associate Librarian during the mid-1970s, Dr. Weinberg implemented bilingual (Yiddish and English) indexing of the Library's classified subject catalog.

As this issue was being prepared for publication, a supplement to the work reviewed was received:

Hebrew Subject Headings: Additions and Changes, July 1992–February 1993, developed by the Hebrew Classification and Cataloging Department, Wurzweiler Central Library, Bar-Ilan University. Ramat Gan, Israel, February 1993. Hebrew section, 201 pp.; English section, 116 pp. ISSN 0792-8572.



Recycling Our Heritage

Out-of-Print
Books

of Jewish Interest

Bought & Sold

Catalogue upon request

Stanley Schwartz Judaica

Dept. JL
1934 Pentuckett Ave.
San Diego, CA 92104-5732
(619) 232-5888

CATALOGING SOFTWARE

**FROM SCARECROW
PRESS...**

LH ONLINE

On-line Public Access Catalog for
IBM /286 or faster Compatibles

*"Libraries interested in an elec-
tronic card catalog without the extra
cost of a circulation system would do
well to examine this powerful but
easy-to-use program." —Vicki Sher-
ouse, Booklist*

ALSO AVAILABLE,
WITH OVER 2,000
ACTIVE USERS...

**The LIBRARIAN'S
HELPER, Version 5.0**

The Professional Card Cataloging
Program

*"For the small library..., The Li-
brarian's Helper is possibly the best
software available at a reasonable
price." —Candy Schwartz, LRTS*

Free IBM-compatible demonstration disks
available for both programs-call today!

SCARECROW PRESS P.O. Box 4167 Metuchen, NJ 08840
1-800-537-7107 or 908-548-8600