6-13-2014

Be-tzelem Elohim—In the Image of God: Identifying Essential Jewish LGBTQ Books for Jewish Libraries

Sheryl F. Stahl
Frances-Henry Library, Hebrew Union College-Jewish Institute of Religion, sstahl@huc.edu

Joel L. Kushner Psy.D.
Hebrew Union College-Jewish Institute of Religion, jkushner@huc.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://ajlpublishing.org/jl

Part of the Collection Development and Management Commons, Jewish Studies Commons, and the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender Studies Commons

Recommended Citation
"The stranger who resides with you shall be to you as one of your citizens; you shall love him as yourself, for you were strangers in the land of Egypt: I the Lord am your God."

Leviticus 19:34

Over millennia, libraries have been safe havens of learning, places where knowledge is gathered and protected, and studied. Even when books were deemed subversive or heretical, some were still preserved, and awareness of those protected texts was transferred from generation to generation. As we know it today, the public library is a “go-to” place for information about sex and sexuality. A young person can look up a word or view a picture of the naked body for the first time, free from the watchful eyes of parents or teachers. While the Internet has significantly replaced this function (Hamer 2003), there are still many people who do not have individual online access, and the library may be the only place that this information is available. In terms of providing comprehensive knowledge on a topic, even the Internet cannot compare with the full resources of a library harnessed by the guidance of its knowledgeable reference staff. Writing about lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and questioning (LGBTQ) teen users of the library, Martin and Murdock (2007, 16) write, “even in a world full of media offerings, books remain the only window into LGBTQ issues—particularly because reading is such a personal and private activity.” While the Internet may provide titillating and easily accessible tidbits, it does not match the satisfying meal of learning that a library and its staff can provide.

The need for a safe haven has been especially important for LGBTQ people. Librarians recognized this fact early on and as society changed its views on homosexuality, so too did librarians. In 1970, it was the American Library Association (ALA) who pioneered the first professional gay interest group in the form of a Task Force on Gay Liberation, later the Gay, Lesbian, Bisex-


2 In his study of college-age gay men, Hamer (2003) found that the men used the Internet to connect with others who could help them learn about gay identity. The forums they used included “chat rooms, listservs, online support groups, and personal Web pages.”

3 The authors of this article commonly use LGBTQ to denote lesbian, gay, bi-sexual, transgender, and queer and to refer to LGBTQ as the population as a whole. When other references or studies are cited, such as Martin and Murdock (2007), that use the “Q” to mean “questioning”, the particular term for the population that the reference includes is retained in this article. Though it can be confusing to see different terms throughout this article—LGBT versus GLBT versus LGBTQ and queer versus questioning—the intent is to maintain the accuracy of the source documents.
ual and Transgender Round Table (GLBTRT). Today, the GLBTRT maintains a webpage with information and resources about GLBT books and related library information and sponsors its annual Stonewall Book Awards, which recognize exceptional merit in depicting GLBT experience in fiction, nonfiction, and children’s and Young Adult literature (ALA 2011). Although library users of LGBTQ materials involve a number of groups, perhaps the most insecure among them are LGBTQ youth and adults who come out later in life. These groups’ first explorations around understanding their sexual orientation and sexual identity are tinged with the awareness of difference, a sense that somehow, “I am not like everyone else but I don’t really understand how.” As Betz (2012) wrote, some of these young people, and even some adults, furtively look up the word “homosexual” in the dictionary or encyclopedia and think, “Is that me?” or in other cases, “That’s me!”.

In the forward to Martin and Murdock’s 2007 book, author David Levithan discusses the power of writing Young Adult gay fiction and the impact it has on teens. His explanation, that “books do not create identities, but they can confirm identities” (ibid., ix–x), is affirmed by the hundreds of emails he has received from teens, expressing how important, and at times lifesaving, his work has been. However, Levithan points out that the thanks that he receives are not only for him, but also for all the people that ensure that books reach those who need them: publishers, editors, booksellers, and especially librarians. Almost as a modern paean to librarians, he writes:

I wish that I could line up all the kids and adults who’ve written to me and have them say thank you to the librarians who opened the door for them. I wish that you could see them, could talk to them, and receive their thanks. I promise that by the twentieth reader you’d be speechless, and by the hundredth you’d be beyond speech. And, mark my words, you would have no doubt: Books matter. (Martin and Murdock 2007, x)

The importance and the need to serve LGBTQ library users cannot be underestimated, yet the reason to include this subject matter is not only to meet the needs of LGBTQ youth and those adults who come out later in life, but also to serve other consumers of LGBTQ materials, such as people with LGBTQ family members and those performing research for academic or professional aims. Also, in one study based on a nationally representative sample of 3,450 students aged thirteen–eighteen, 75 percent of students knew someone who was gay, lesbian, or bisexual (Harris Interactive and GLSEN 2005). For 55 percent of the respondents, that “someone” was another student, but whether the other 20 percent are parents or teachers or neighbors, these students who know someone who is LGBTQ need accessible information and exposure to LGBTQ materials, both for understanding and for normalization.

Despite the ALA’s early inclusion of a GLBT Task Force, Garner (2000) wrote that in the field of library and information science, the needs of the LGBT community were “discussed infrequently, studied less, and never treated in their totality.” Seven years later, Martin and Murdock published Serving Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, and Questioning Teens: A How-To-Do-It Manual for Librarians (2007), the most comprehensive review of the topic to date. While there
were more studies on LGBTQ information needs by 2007, there was still a relative dearth of material. Furthermore, Martin and Murdock’s book makes almost no mention of LGBTQ issues relevant to libraries in religious settings. In 2013, the authors of this article could not find a single study on the needs of LGBTQ patrons of Jewish libraries. The authors of this article take as a given that all libraries should include materials on LGBTQ issues. This article will discuss the challenges involved specifically when considering LGBTQ Jewish materials in Jewish libraries and will provide annotated bibliographies of essential holdings for a range of Jewish libraries.

MORE THAN JUST A SPACE ISSUE

Whether a library is a stand-alone center, or a department within a larger institution, libraries always deal with limited shelf space. But shelf room is not the only deterrent to LGBTQ collection development. Martin and Murdock (2007, 29) formulate a number of hypotheses to explain the lack not only of materials, but also of services for LGBTQ youth in libraries, and then review studies that support many of these hypotheses:

- Fear of book challenges;
- Fear that if a controversy does arise, the library will lose funding;
- Assumption that other libraries will address lacunae in its own collection;
- Lack of awareness, or outright denial, that LGBTQ teens frequent the library;
- Lack of knowledge about LGBTQ issues—or fear of them;
- Homophobia on the part of the librarian.

According to analyses by the Williams Institute of the 2010 Census data (Gates and Cooke 2011), same-sex couples exist in every congressional district and in 93 percent of counties in the United States. These statistics speak to the idea that there are gay and lesbian people throughout the United States, and not just on the coasts or in big cities. Even though the 2010 Census was conducted three years after Martin and Murdock published their 2007 book, the numbers should still support the idea that there are potential gay and lesbian patrons for almost every library in the country. Alexander and Miselis (2007) suggest that librarians may also be concerned that acquiring resources that show positive gay images would imply that they, their library, or their larger institution is making a “pro-gay” statement. In some religious contexts, this may go against the overarching culture, or the actual theology, of the institution. Librarians may also find it difficult to discover quality materials. On the one hand, LGBTQ books are less likely to be reviewed in major literary journals (Loverich and Degnan 1999), although this has improved in recent years. And on the other hand, as LGBTQ issues and characters start appearing more in mainstream books, they are harder to single out (Thomas 2007).
Given the size and number of all of the patron groups that have been mentioned and the magnitude of their need, it is crucial to examine how Jewish libraries address collection development policies and create an environment that facilitates learning and scholarship on LGBTQ subjects. For Judaica collections, in addition to the question of theology and the levels of acceptance of homosexuality, another complicating issue is the differing types of libraries and centers with related but unique missions. Is the appropriate collection development policy for a Jewish research library the same as a synagogue library or a seminary library? In response to real concerns and differing environments, Martin and Murdock have developed a tiered system for finding the best pace for change to build an LGBTQ collection which includes fours speeds: Red Light, Yellow Light, Green Light, and School Zone (2007, 125). For each speed, corresponding guides indicate how to proceed with collection development, programming, book talks, and atmosphere. While this system does not address the question of diversity of library missions, it does offer guidance that is relevant to, and could be adapted for, more traditional Jewish library settings. Ultimately, the annotated bibliographies at the end of this article will identify specifically Jewish LGBTQ literature for a range of different types of Jewish libraries. Then taken in conjunction with strategies like Martin and Murdock’s model, these materials can then be incorporated into individual Jewish libraries.

**CHALLENGES FOR LIBRARIES WITH LGBTQ SUBJECT MATTER**

While libraries have always had the challenging task of identifying which resources to collect amidst competing factors of financial constraints and physical space limitations, in the case of materials on sexuality, and homosexuality in particular, this task is significantly complicated by both political and religious influences. For the large part of the twentieth century, homosexuality has been an anathema for the general public in the United States. The framework for understanding homosexuality was medically based in the psychiatric and psychoanalytical fields and focused on homosexuality as deviance or a disease. There have been small pockets of support, such as the Mattachine Society in Los Angeles, founded in 1951 as one of the first known homosexual political organizations in the United States (Meeker 2004), and the Daughters of Bilitis in San Francisco, which was founded in 1955 as the first lesbian civil and political rights organization (Gallo 2004), but every state in the country has had laws against homosexual behavior. Thousands of gays were dishonorably discharged after World War II, and President Eisenhower issued an executive order that sexual perversion (meaning homosexuality) was a legitimate reason to fire a federal employee from his or her job.4 For all the country to see, Senator Joseph McCarthy and others linked the Lavender Scare with the Red Scare and aggressively used accusations of homosexuality as a threat in their campaigns (The University of Chicago 2004).

In spite of the certainty of such political positions, over the last forty-five years, the minority pockets of support and dissent have surged, transforming the once black-and-white issue into a rainbow of opinions. Given the relative speed of this shift, libraries have also needed to deter-

---

4 For a timeline of events, see the online component of the PBS program, “American Experience: Stonewall Uprising” (WGBH Educational Foundation 2011).
mine how quickly to respond to these issues. The changes that have occurred have not translated into a uniformly positive view of homosexuality; rather, there is now a range of views in most communities, with radically more support from the civil arena and a great breadth of opinion from the religious perspective, including positive support. Thus, it is a complex task for libraries to decide which “norm” or trend to respond to. The American Psychiatric Association and the American Psychological Association both declassified homosexuality as a mental disorder in 1973 and 1975 respectively (American Psychological Association 1974, 1998; APA 2008, 2011, Guideline 2, paragraph 2; Conger 1975; Fox 1988). Yet it has taken another thirty-five years for the United States government to move toward full legal equality for lesbian and gay citizens. This includes the right for lesbian and gay people to be civilly married, to serve openly in the armed forces, and for LGBTQ people to enjoy equal status with regard to visitation by partners/husbands/wives in hospitals (White House 2011).

**TRANSFORMING ATTITUDES AMONG JEWISH DENOMINATIONS**

Until the late twentieth century, Jewish denominational views on homosexuality were for the most part clear and simple. Rabbis and scholars read from the Hebrew Bible, Leviticus 18:22, “Do not lie with a male as one lies with a woman; it is a *to evah*,” and concluded that homosexuality is an abomination and a sin. In the past several decades in the non-Orthodox Jewish community, progress toward a more diverse and inclusive understanding of homosexuality has been steady but not without challenges (Eger 2001; Hertz 2007). In 1984, the Reconstructionist seminary faculty became the first to vote to admit a gay or lesbian seminary student and the first student matriculated in 1985. In 1990, the Reform movement’s seminary, Hebrew Union College-Jewish Institute of Religion (HUC-JIR), voted to omit sexual orientation as an exclusionary criterion for admission. In 2003, HUC-JIR admitted the first transgender student to rabbinical school. In 2014, the Central Conference of American Rabbis Press published *The Sacred Encounter: Jewish Perspectives on Sexuality*, edited by Rabbi Lisa J. Grushcow (Grushcow and Ellenson 2014). This volume is an expansive exploration of the topic that includes both LGBT

---

5 The “Defense of Marriage Act” (DOMA) passed in 1996 indicated that states did not have to recognize the same-sex marriages performed in other states and further that same-sex marriage would not be recognized by the Federal Government. Section 3 of this act, which covered the Federal Government, was found to be unconstitutional by the United States Supreme Court in 2013.

6 “Don’t Ask, Don’t Tell” (DADT) legislated that the military would no longer seek out gay or lesbian service people but would still discharge members who admitted to being gay or lesbian. DADT was repealed on December 22, 2010, thus allowing gays and lesbians to serve openly.

7 While there may be a wide variation in practice, hospital visitation policies have generally restricted visitors based on a limited definition of biological and/or legal family. Since most states do not recognize same-sex marriages, this meant that gay and lesbian partners could be kept from seeing their spouse who was a patient, and that the spouse/partner neither had access to the patient’s medical information nor was able to make medical decisions for them. President Obama’s memorandum on hospital visitation (President. Memorandum 2010) directed hospitals to create rules that allowed patients to designate who should be allowed visitation, thereby granting GLBTQ patients the same opportunity to have their spouses/partners with them that their straight counterparts have.

8 One of the authors of this article, Joel L. Kushner also has a chapter in this edited volume, entitled “Assessing Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender Inclusion in the Reform Movement: A Promise Fulfilled or a Promise in Progress?”.
and heterosexual perspectives from predominantly Reform contributors, but also from writers across and beyond the denominational spectrum. The Conservative Movement’s Committee on Jewish Law and Standards (CJLS) adopted a complex series of *teshuvot* (responsa) in 2006, one of which allowed for the entrance of gay and lesbian students into its seminary. The Movement’s West Coast seminary at the University of Judaism (now the American Jewish University) immediately began accepting gay and lesbian candidates. The Jewish Theological Seminary (JTS) in New York, the Movement’s founding institution, discussed the issue internally with faculty before also admitting gay and lesbian students in March 2007. The status of bisexual applicants was raised in 2008, and after a period of time, JTS clarified its new policy, stating that it would admit students “of all sexual orientations”. Currently the Reform, Reconstructionist and Conservative movements all also offer marriage ceremonies for two people of the same gender.9

There is no question that the Orthodox community holds to a literal and legally binding interpretation of the Hebrew Bible including Leviticus 18:22 and 20:13, the verses most commonly used to condemn homosexuality. Rabbi Uri Cohen (2006), a fellow of the Academy for Torah Initiatives and Directions (ATID), has developed a comprehensive annotated bibliography of contemporary Orthodox responses to homosexuality that reveal the many continuing discussions about this topic. Unlike other denominations, which have central organizational bodies, the Orthodox community in the United States and internationally is divided into many different branches. Although most of the sources in Cohen’s bibliography are against homosexuality, he includes exceptions like Rabbi Chaim Rapoport (2004), who holds a pastoral view that someone who is gay and cannot be any other way should not marry someone of the opposite gender. Additionally, the bibliography includes works by Shmuley Boteach, an orthodox rabbi, author, and TV host who for many years has been named one of the most influential rabbis in the country. He holds more tolerant views while still upholding the biblical prohibition. Rabbi Boteach (2010A, 2010B) believes that homosexuality is a religious but not a moral sin, and his advice to gay people is that there are 611 other commandments for them to work on. He further counsels the general public not to spend so much time and energy worrying about what the gay people are doing and instead to focus on more important concerns, like decreasing the divorce rate among heterosexuals and raising children in a Jewish home.

In the past five to ten years, particularly in the modern Orthodox community in academic and religious settings, there has also been a greater openness and tolerance of gays and lesbians while still upholding the biblical prohibitions of Leviticus 18:22. In 2009, the Orthodox institution Yeshiva University (YU) held a forum called “Being Gay in the Modern Orthodox World”, which featured a panel of gay students and alumni, with YU administrators serving as moderators.

9 Like the interchangeable usage of the terms LGBT and GLBT, “same-sex” couples or marriage, and “same gender” marriage or couples, appear in different contexts with the authors of those contexts having specific reasons for their choices of language. DOMA and the Reconstructionist movement uses the language of “same-sex marriage” (http://www.rrc.edu/news-media/news/reconstructionist-movement-endorse-civil-marriage-same-sex-couples), while the Reform movement discusses “same gender officiation” and “same-gender couples” (https://www.ccar.net.org/rabbis-speak/resolutions/2000/same-gender-officiation/). This article strives to maintain the usage of the original source document or context when referring to a particular term.
and post-panel commentators (Lipman 2009). This forum attracted several hundred students, faculty, and local community members; and while still controversial and divisive, it revealed a level of interest, honesty, and support that had never previously been seen. It was also a catalyst that sparked continuing discussion, including one of the first “non-anonymous” gay articles in the school newspaper (Kirshstein 2012). The YU forum also inspired Rabbi Nathaniel Helfgot, who teaches Bible and Jewish Thought at Chovevei Torah Rabbinical School in New York, to draft a document that laid out a positive pastoral message and guide for people who are homosexual, while still upholding the biblical halacha on the issue. This paper, entitled “Statement of Principles on the Place of Jews with a Homosexual Orientation in Our Community”, ultimately became a collaboration with Rabbi Aryeh Klapper, Rabbi Yitzchak Blau and “dozens of talmidei chachamim, educators, communal rabbis, mental health professionals and a number of individuals in our community who are homosexual in orientation” (Helfgot 2010). As of December 2013, over two hundred Orthodox rabbis, educators, and mental health professionals in Israel and the United States have signed it.

In the same time period as the movement in academic and religious settings, there have also been a burgeoning number of LGBT Orthodox groups developing both in the United States and Israel (e.g., Eshel, Tirtzah, Hod, Havruta, Bat Kol). Steven Greenberg (2013) discusses several of these as well as a variety of positive steps in the Orthodox community in relationship to LGBT issues. What does the presence of these groups and their growing activities mean? While there is no question that there continues to be majority opposition from Orthodox Judaism on these issues, as documented in Cohen’s annotated bibliography (2006), development and continued growth of support speak to increasing diversity of opinion. Catalysts are most easily identified retrospectively. When we look back on this time period, the 2009 YU forum, the Helfgot 2010 statement of principles, the development of the groups by LGBT Orthodox people themselves, may likely be seen as a snapshot of a catalytic change in process, one that will affect and shape how the Orthodox Movement deals with homosexuality for years to come.

**WHY INCLUDE LGBTQ JEWISH SUBJECT MATTER**

This article proposes that despite complications from both the secular and the religious points of view there are compelling reasons to include LGBTQ Jewish materials in Jewish libraries. The ALA’s Bill of Rights affirms that, “Libraries should provide materials and information presenting all points of view on current and historical issues. Materials should not be proscribed or removed because of partisan or doctrinal disapproval” (American Library Association 1996). Furthermore, the ALA’s Core Values of Librarianship (2004) maintains: “We value our nation’s diversity and strive to reflect that diversity by providing a full spectrum of resources and services to the communities we serve.” It should also be noted that the Association of Jewish Libraries (AJL) is an affiliate of the ALA. Judaism affirms that all human beings are created be-tselem elohim, in the image of God, and promotes the sacred belief in pikuah nefesh, the saving of a life. Both of these values have direct influence on what is practiced in Jewish libraries.

---

A study assessing LGBTQ-themed literature in public high school libraries (Hughes-Hassell et al. 2013) found that while LGBT teens are estimated to make up 5.9 percent of American high school students, the average number of LGBT-themed titles held by these school libraries is 0.4 percent. This discrepancy seems to fall short of the aspiration of ALA’s Core Values of Librarianship (2004) quoted above. The 2008 General Social Survey (GSS) found that 10.2 percent of the Jewish population identified themselves as gay, lesbian, or bisexual (General Social Survey 2008). Given that this figure is even higher than Hughes-Hassell et al. (2013), how likely is it that Jewish collections are doing better than public school libraries in making sure that their collections are representative of their patrons?

While shelf space is always a challenge for libraries, collection development decisions are not entirely based on quantitative assessments of the library’s users. The authors of this article argue that in addition to ALA’s Bill of Rights, Jewish libraries have a special ethical imperative based on foundational Jewish values to supply information to a vulnerable minority. As Jewish institutions, we subscribe to many commonly held Jewish values, including the value of pikuah nefesh (the saving of a life). This holds that the saving of one life overrides the performance of almost all commandments. LGBTQ people, and especially youth, are at much greater risk for homelessness, bullying, drug use, and suicide (Brooks 2010). Providing them with accurate information and positive images of LGBTQ characters affirms their value as human beings, Jews, and members of the community. It is therefore not an exaggeration to say that this kind of affirmation can save a Jewish life. We wonder that if every human being is created in the image of God, if we deprive one person of the rights and responsibilities that are given to everyone else, then are we not also disrespecting an aspect of God? Jay Michaelson (2011, xvii) creates a religious case in support of LGBTQ people, by employing various biblical verses to demonstrate how the Tanakh preaches “the centrality of love and relationship in God’s design of the Universe”. Michaelson does not shy away from any biblical portions and even discusses those verses most often used to condemn LGBTQ people, including Leviticus 18:22, asserting that this passage is as open to interpretation and exploration as other passages are. He compares the treatment of this portion of Leviticus to the Ten Commandments. While the sixth commandment says, “You shall not murder” (Exodus 20:13), killing is allowed or even condoned in war or in self-defense. Similarly, according to Michaelson, both the specifics of the meaning of Leviticus 18:22, as well as how it is applied, can be examined to find situations where the rule both does and does not apply.

For many years, Jews have been known as “People of the Book”, but this designation has obscured the role of Jews as “People of the Body”. Even in the Tanakh, Jews discussed many aspects of sex, sexuality, and body issues. Physical existence is an important part of the human experience, which the Tanakh and later rabbis examined for centuries in detail, with topics ranging from bad breath to bowel movements and menstruation to masturbation (Eilberg-Schwartz 1992). Male homosexuality has also been examined greatly as part of these discussions,11 as have explorations about what we would now consider intersex and transgender issues (Dzmura 2010).

11 A search of the Bar Ilan Responsa Project for the phrase mishkav zakhor (lying with a male) resulted in 249 hits, including from the Talmud, biblical commentaries, and Responsa.
Discussions about LGBTQ issues continue today in all denominations and streams of Judaism, as is discussed later in this article. These discussions have at times led, and in other cases followed, trends in the wider civil society.

In addition to the ethical considerations, Jyl Lynn Felman (1994) makes a literary argument for including LGBTQ materials in Jewish libraries. She contends that Jews have a history of transgressing social norms in literature, pushing boundaries and speaking truth to power. Across genres and fields, from midrashic literature (Abraham smashing his father’s idols) to politics and Zionism, to fiction, and to poetry, Jews have named truths that society did not want to hear. Felman concludes that, “In every generation Jewish writers boldly transgress the boundaries of what Jews are allowed to write and speak publicly about” (1994, 119). By censoring LGBTQ materials, libraries are denying a truth and making invisible the LGBTQ community members and patrons who care about them.

Andrea Jacobs (2006) draws on queer theory to call on Jewish libraries “to queer the library”, thereby creating an institution that is welcoming to all Jews in our current diverse world. Writing on queer Jewish education, Shneer (2002, 143) explains that, “‘queering’ is about breaking normative models of Jewish values, heroes, and history and emphasizing different aspects of Jewish culture and tradition.” Applied to libraries, this means both including LGBTQ materials and viewing materials through a lens that breaks through mainstream frames and takes into account the perspective of the marginalized. Jacobs (2006, 7) anticipates and responds to several potential critiques that librarians who include GLBT materials may encounter, including this thoughtful response:

Those of you who are librarians in day schools may also be accused of exposing young children to “sex” or “sexuality” by virtue of having books with gay characters or books about coming out or gay identity. To these critics I would reply that by having books or sources in your library that condemn homosexuality you are already exposing children to “sex” and “sexuality.”

**TERMINOLOGY AND LANGUAGE USAGE**

Language and terminology constantly evolve to create an ever-changing sense of what is current and appropriate usage. What was once “homosexual” became “gay” and then “gay and lesbian”, and now “lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and queer” (LGBTQ). On college campuses the list grows even longer, adding the categories of “questioning”, “intersex”, “ally”, and “asexual” (LGBTQ-QIAA), as well as “gender non-conforming”, “same-gender loving”, and more. In current common usage, the word “gay” now encompasses both men and women in the generic sense. “Queer” is also used as a current umbrella term to represent the spectrum of sexual orientations and gender identities, although it contains more complex meanings and its acceptance often varies based on age and demographics.
An expanding understanding of gender identity has also created a large body of evolving terms as well as confusion around their meaning, such as “transvestite”, “transsexual”, and “transgender”. These terms and others are often lumped together by a medical, psychological, or academic institution under the umbrella term of “transgender”, which in reality encompasses disparate experiences and identities. Because of this external designation, not every individual who is labeled thus would agree that they belong there. Rabbinic literature was familiar with multiple types of gender, including the androgynous (a person born with both male and female genitals), the ṭumṭum (a person born with no distinctive male or female genitals), the aylonit (a person born with female genitals who does not develop at puberty and can’t give birth), and the saris (a person who lacks male genitals at birth or due to human intervention or injury). These more complex understandings of gender were not as frequently discussed in modern times in Jewish settings, and obscurity around this knowledge has persisted to modern times (Kukla 2006a; 2006b; 2009). Writing from his ultra-Orthodox community in 1999, Rabbi Alfred Cohen’s article is an early example of reflection on the ancient rabbinic understandings of gender, how they interact with modern understandings of intersex conditions, and how the current medical responses to those conditions relate to traditional halacha on the topic. However, it was not until Kukla (ibid.), Zellman (2007), and Dzmura’s 2010 anthology were published, that writing on this topic became more readily available. In a related fashion, Thompson (2012) discusses how an invisibility and absence of discussion has perpetuated the lack of service for the needs of transgender patrons of libraries. Rapid changes in language mean that even effectively categorizing LGBTQ materials is a challenge to both collection development and the training of librarians to stay up to date with current usage in the medical, psychological and vernacular cultures. In turn, this affects librarians’ ability to be able to provide the best experience for the library patron.

Access

Ironically, even understanding the current terms will not necessarily make it easier to find LGBTQ materials in libraries. LGBTQ issues span many different fields (cultural, sociological, medical, psychological, to name a few), and each field has its own vocabulary. There is also a time lag between when a term starts being used colloquially and when it appears in print, especially in scholarly publications. This process of a term being, if not set in stone, then at least set in monographic print, is called “literary warrant.” It was described by Edward Wyndham Hulme in 1911 (cited in Johnson 2010) and adopted by the Library of Congress (LC) that creates the subject headings used by most academic libraries as a tool for cataloging materials, and thus for searching. In the LC workflow, adding or updating a subject heading is not considered unless a new published work requires it and a cataloger either at the LC or at another library suggests the change; the new subject heading then needs to be evaluated before it is approved (Library of Congress 2001.) The Library of Congress Subject Heading (LCSH) list was developed to be used

* Editor’s note: Vikishivah, a Wikipedia-like encyclopedia for Jewish terms (Hebrew only), operated and maintained by the Beit-El Yeshiva Center in Israel, provides comprehensive references in its entries for these terms. Accessed May 27, 2014. [http://tinyurl.com/ld5pmsw](http://tinyurl.com/ld5pmsw).
in first in the LC’s own library and then expanded to include many academic and public libraries. It is often not a comfortable fit for any specialized library, such as a Judaica or LGBTQ collection, and many fields have developed their own systems of subject headings and call numbers. Matt Johnson (2010) examines several of these schemas for LGBTQ terms but acknowledges that while some of them might be more appropriate for LGBTQ collections, they are unlikely to be adopted over the ubiquitous LCSH.

The list of LCSH featured in Tables 1 and 2 includes the specifically Jewish term when it exists and the more general one when it does not. The lack of terms such as “Jewish bisexuals”, “genderqueer”, or “gender fluid” could mean that a book has not yet been written on these topics; that a cataloger has not yet requested that these terms be created; or that it is in the evaluation process. In fact, there are articles and chapters on these subjects (Gorlin 2007; Harrison et al. 2012), but since catalogers tend to focus on the main themes of the book when assigning subject headings, the topics of single chapters may be overlooked. While these challenges are not at all unique to LGBTQ issues, and indeed are shared by all rapidly changing fields, they can leave a library patron somewhat at a loss.

**Table 1.** Selected Library of Congress Subject Headings on Judaism and Sexuality: Topical LCSH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topical Subject Headings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sexual Orientation—Religious Aspects—Judaism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homosexuality—Religious Aspects—Judaism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homosexuality In the Bible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesbianism—Religious Aspects—Judaism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homosexuality, Male—Religious Aspects—Judaism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bisexuality—Religious Aspects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heterosexuality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queer Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transsexualism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intersexuality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2.** Selected Library of Congress Subject Headings on Judaism and Sexuality: LCSH referring to people

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject Headings Referring to People</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jewish gays</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jewish lesbians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jewish gay men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesbian rabbis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bisexuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bisexual men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bisexual women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jewish transgender people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jewish transsexuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jewish sexual minorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female-to-male transsexuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male-to-female transsexuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intersex people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transvestites</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sources for LGBTQ and Jewish LGBTQ Information**

Of course access to information implies more than just finding a book on the shelf. Any library can produce pathfinders to their LGBTQ collections, guiding their patrons on how to find materials and also demonstrating that the topic is of importance to the library. There are also many blogs and other social media devoted to Jewish LGBTQ topics, but examining those is beyond the scope of this article. We can, however, provide a general introduction to relevant websites and information. Table 3 features these resources, discussed in the following paragraphs.
Table 3. Online resources for LGBTQ and Jewish LGBTQ information (asterisk indicates subscription-based resource)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource Name</th>
<th>Resource Type and Updates</th>
<th>URL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALA’s GLBTRT Round Table</td>
<td>Book reviews</td>
<td><a href="http://www.glbtrt.ala.org/reviews/">http://www.glbtrt.ala.org/reviews/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lambda Literary</td>
<td>Book reviews</td>
<td><a href="http://www.lambdaliterary.org">http://www.lambdaliterary.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library Journal</td>
<td>Book reviews</td>
<td><a href="http://lj.libraryjournal.com">http://lj.libraryjournal.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGBT Life (EBSCO)*</td>
<td>Database</td>
<td><a href="http://www.ebscohost.com/academic/lgbt-life">http://www.ebscohost.com/academic/lgbt-life</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGBT Thought and Culture (Alexander Street)*</td>
<td>Database</td>
<td><a href="http://alexanderstreet.com/products/lgbt-thought-and-culture">http://alexanderstreet.com/products/lgbt-thought-and-culture</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Watch (ProQuest)*</td>
<td>Database</td>
<td><a href="http://www.proquest.com/products-services/genderwatch.html">http://www.proquest.com/products-services/genderwatch.html</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography: by, for, and/or about Jewish Lesbian/Bisexual Women (Terren Ilana Wein)</td>
<td>Bibliography (2003)</td>
<td><a href="http://wjudaism.library.utoronto.ca/index.php/wjudaism/rt/printerFriendly/206/18/4">http://wjudaism.library.utoronto.ca/index.php/wjudaism/rt/printerFriendly/206/18/4</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institute for Judaism, Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity (HUC-JIR)</td>
<td>Website (Current)</td>
<td><a href="http://huc.edu/jso">http://huc.edu/jso</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keshet</td>
<td>Website (Current)</td>
<td><a href="http://www.keshetonline.org">http://www.keshetonline.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TransTorah</td>
<td>Website (Current)</td>
<td><a href="http://transtorah.org">http://transtorah.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Jeff Herman Virtual Resource Center (JHVRRC)</td>
<td>Annotated references (Current)</td>
<td><a href="http://elearning.huc.edu/jhvr/int_res.php">http://elearning.huc.edu/jhvr/int_res.php</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Professional Tools section of ALA’s GLBTRT website provides booklists on religion, with a short section on Judaism. It also includes a link to its review page, which offers detailed reviews of LGBTQ literature, and while not focusing on Jewish works, does include some. In both its paper journal, *Lambda Book Report* magazine, and its free online sister publication, the *Lambda Literary*, the Lambda Literary Foundation also produces lengthy reviews of LGBT literature and author interviews. *Library Journal* publishes periodic articles on various combinations of LGBTQ books, searchable by the terms “collection development” and “gay” or “lesbian”, etc.

Research libraries could provide access to journal indexes that include or focus on LGBTQ issues, such as EBSCO’s *LGBT Life*. Other databases to consider are *LGBT Thought and Culture* of Alexander Street Press and *Gender Watch* of ProQuest. While non-academic libraries may not be able to afford database subscriptions, they can still provide links to articles and websites that offer extensive resources at the intersection of Judaism, sexual orientation, and gender iden-

13 ALA’s GLBTRT review page: http://www.glbtrt.ala.org/reviews/.
14 The *Lambda Literary*: http://www.lambdaliterary.org/.
tity. Published in *Women in Judaism: A Multidisciplinary Journal*, Terren Ilana Wein (2002) produced an annotated bibliography “by, for, and/or about” Jewish lesbians and bisexual women. This list contains many articles sourced from both small and overlooked journals, as well as long-forgotten books not included in other LGBT resource lists. Wein’s bibliography was updated in 2003 and is available online.19

In another narrowly focused work, Lucia Cedeira (2003) compiled a resource page on the Gay Holocaust for the ALA’s GLBT Round Table. This bibliography includes ten sections covering the persecution of gays, as well as sections about the history of homosexuality in Germany “before and during the Nazis”, Nazi ideology on homosexuals, Revisionism, biographies, fiction, films, and more.20 Cedeira writes, “The purpose of this guide is present resources not only about the Gay Holocaust itself, but also about the situation of Germany and the homosexuals before the Nazis.” The topic of gays and Jews in the Holocaust is of interest to LGBTQ Jews of today, as it is one way to connect themselves to a tradition that cast them out for thousands of years. By rediscovering and reclaiming these stories, LGBT Jews today are able to say, “see, we have always been present and part of *Klal Yisroel.*” While Cedeira’s resource contains sections on gays in the Holocaust and articles on Jews in the Holocaust, there are also a number of resources that focus on people who were both Jewish and gay/lesbian, such as Magnus Hirschfeld, Gad Beck, and Felice Schragenheim (Jaguar of *Aimee and Jaguar*; see the book and film entries in the Annotated Bibliography section below), as well as Lev Raphael, a contemporary gay author and child of Holocaust survivors who has written about these themes. Magnus Hirschfeld, for example, is described as the “zayde” (grandfather) of gay liberation and a “long-forgotten martyr [who] has been found and resurrected” (Young 1977, cited in Porter 1981, 139). There are also journal articles that directly compare the two populations, of gays and Jews, like “History/Hysteria: Parallel Representations of Jews and Gays, Lesbians and Bisexuals” (Blumenfeld 1996), or “Swastika, Pink Triangle and Yellow Star: The Destruction of Sexology and the Persecution of Homosexuals in Nazi Germany” (Giles 1981).

One of the earliest GLBT Jewish archives, called Twice Blessed–The Jewish GLBT Archive, was created by Canadian Johnny Abush. This archive includes a vast range of print, film, video, audio, chronologies of events and ceremonies, music, performances, and ephemera. The collection’s growth stopped in 2000 when Abush passed away, but much of it is accessible online through the ONE National Gay & Lesbian Archives.21


Two contemporary websites that offer specific resources, as well as larger aggregated lists of sources about LGBT Jewish information, are HUC-JIR’s Institute for Judaism, Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity and its Jeff Herman Virtual Resource Center (JHVRC),22 and Keshet (a rainbow, in Hebrew), a “national grassroots organization that works for the full equality and inclusion of LGBT Jews in Jewish life.”23

Keshet offers an excellent key resource document for Jewish educators, compiled by Ann Abrams, the librarian of Temple Israel of Boston (Abrams 2013).24 In one location, this non-annotated list pulls together both Jewish and non-Jewish LGBT books, films, and organizational websites. The Keshet website also has many short lesson plans and curriculum ideas for educators; links to Torah Queeries, a series of over 150 short essays on each Torah portion and most holidays written from an LGBTQ lens; transgender text studies; information on Hineini (see under the Films in the Annotated Bibliography section below), the documentary film that Keshet produced; as well as sharing Keshet’s training and advocacy programs from across the country.

The Institute for Judaism, Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity at HUC-JIR and its Jeff Herman Virtual Resource Center (JHVRC)25 maintain the world largest online collection of annotated references of Jewish LGBT books, articles, films, and websites. The JHVRC is arranged in broad categories, such as “Intersections of Judaism and LGBT issues”; “LGBT Pastoral Care; Individuals & Families”; “Same Gender Marriage”; “Heterosexism, Homophobia, Biphobia and Transphobia”; “History and Civil Rights Issues of being LGBT”; “About HIV/AIDS”; and “Art, Film & Literature”. Each of these categories is yet further subdivided. For example, the two subsections under the heading of “Intersections of Judaism and LGBT issues” are “Bible, Halacha and Homosexuality”, and “Celebrating Multiple Identities”. Together these contain over 175 annotated links to resources. Under the “Liturgy and Ritual” section, there are dozens of references for liturgy, rituals, and prayers for LGBT Jews and those that love them that highlight and celebrate the kedusha (holiness) in everyday life events as well as the larger celebrated lifecycle events. The larger website of the IJSO also hosts denominational reports, policies, responsa and other documents on LGBT-related topics from the Conservative, Humanistic, Liberal Judaism (United Kingdom), Orthodox, Reconstructionist, Reform, and Renewal movements. The website maintains a growing list of LGBT Jewish organizations around the world as well as a map of LGBT and LGBT-welcoming synagogues. The Inclusion section provides resources, both Jewish and non-Jewish, to help organizations become open and welcoming to LGBT Jews and their loved ones.

22 HUC-JIR’s Institute for Judaism, Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity: http://huc.edu/ijso.


25 The Jeff Herman Virtual Resource Center (JHVRC), the Institute for Judaism, Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity at HUC-JIR: http://elearning.huc.edu/jhvr/int_res.php.
The website TransTorah developed by two transgender rabbis, Elliot Kukla and Reuben Zellman, has possibly the largest concentration of Jewish and Transgender resource materials. Its Resources section is divided into the following ones: “Ritual and Liturgy”; “Essays, Sermons, and Poems”; “Video”; and “Art”. Within each section, there are links to other websites and to PDF documents, written by Kukla, Zellman, and others. One of these contributors, Vered Meir, compiled the document “Resources for Transgender Jews, Their Families, Friends, Communities, and Allies” (Meir 2009), that extensively reviews resources on the TransTorah, Keshet, and Jewish Mosaic (subsequently merged with Keshet) websites. This list includes the following section headings: “Community and Educational Materials/101 Resources”; “Personal Accounts—Transgender Jewish Identity”; “Jewish Rituals”; “Jewish Texts and Sermons”; “Orthodoxy”; and “Articles—General”. The one downside to this guide is that since Jewish Mosaic was merged with Keshet, many of the resource URLs to the Jewish Mosaic articles ceased to function. In most cases, the resources are still available but need to be individually searched for within the Keshet website.

**ADDRESSING DIVERSE MISSIONS**

From centers of early childhood education to Ph.D. granting programs’ libraries, and from Jewish renewal to black-hat Orthodox congregations—every community and library has to decide how to best collect and disseminate information about sexual orientation and gender identity. Each has to determine which types of emotional and physical relationships are appropriate within a Jewish context and which types of information can be shared in their spaces. Should supportive material on same-sex civil marriages be present or should only material against it be allowed? Is it possible to follow commandments about modesty and still include information on heterosexual or same-sex physical relationships? Can information on people who feel that they were born into the wrong body (i.e., identifying as transgender) be included and for how young a population (Brill and Pepper 2008)? Libraries’ users include those who struggle with these issues directly, those who have family members or friends affected by these issues, and patrons doing scholarly research on these topics. There are strong feelings surrounding all sides of these issues, and we believe that it is the role of Jewish libraries to provide thoughtful, accurate information about them.

Obviously, each library’s mission informs the criteria used in making collections decisions. Academic and research libraries support the broadest range of material, including the radical edges of the points of view. A survey of university libraries’ mission statements showed that the majority includes language about supporting research (Bangert 1997). The same article showed that this was also a priority for colleges and specialized institutions. Scholars look for resources about homosexuality, transsexuality, and intersex people from every point of view. They need to know historical contexts and changing attitudes. So, too, would a scholar at a Jewish library need to ex-

---


amine materials about the psychological, sociological, biological, and religious aspects of topics related to sexuality, regardless of the institution’s denominational affiliation. Just as the rabbis historically disagreed but preserved multiple opinions, so too should libraries provide resources that reflect both the majority and minority attitudes of their particular patron groups. Indeed, it is librarians’ responsibility to provide nonjudgmental support to all members of the community. The authors believe that seminary libraries, as purveyors of academic and professional training, should be aligned with academic and research libraries. For educational purposes, seminary libraries should include materials that express the views of all the major denominations, even if the particular seminary represents one particular view. This means that the Reform seminary libraries should have *Kulanu = (all of us): A Program and Resource Guide for Gay, Lesbian, Bisexual, and Transgender Inclusion, Revised and Expanded* (Address et al. 2007), Rapoport’s *Judaism and Homosexuality: An Authentic Orthodox View* (Rapoport 2004), Greenberg’s *Wrestling with God and Men: Homosexuality in the Jewish Tradition* (Greenberg 2004), and links to the Conservative Movement’s 2006 *teshuvot* (responsa) deliberations on these topics. There is no single book that encapsulates the Conservative perspective on aspects of certain LGBTQ issues in the same manner that the Address et al., Rapoport, and Greenberg books do. The same is true for the Reconstructionist movement, although it is closer to the Reform view of LGBTQ issues. So too, should the libraries of the non-denominational Jewish seminaries hold a range of books addressing the diversity of viewpoints on the topic.

On the other hand, synagogue, community center, and day school libraries probably have more focused collections and narrower mission statements than research and academic libraries. There may also be differences between community centers with a pluralistic Jewish model and synagogues and day schools that are denominationally affiliated. The former would by definition need to reflect the diversity of views among the denominations. The authors of this article were not able to find any studies of mission statements of synagogue, day school, or center libraries; however, the five mission statements located on AJL’s website, with examples sent by a libraries responding to a request posted on ha-Safran, AJL’s listserv, offered language that focused on serving all members of the community:

1. “. . . provide for all of the information needs of its patrons . . .” (Astor Judaica Library, Lawrence Family Jewish Community Center, San Diego, CA);

---


30 On October 2, 2013, Sheryl Stahl, one of the authors of this article, posted the following request on ha-Safran: “Do any of your day school or synagogue libraries have mission statements? And if so, would you mind sharing it with me?” Six libraries responded. The quotes above were from the samples on the AJL website and from this informal survey.
2. “. . . bring a positive experience for every library user” (Temple Beth Am, Miami, FL);

3. “to promote. . . lifelong reading and study. . . as well as its relevance to our lives today” (Congregation B’nai Moshe, West Bloomfield, MI);

4. “. . . As well as ideas about education on Judaism and in all its aspects”;

5. “. . . creates an atmosphere that encourages students and faculty to explore more fully the classroom subjects that interest them, expand their imaginations, and delve into areas of personal interest” (Library/Media Center, Doris and Alex Weber Jewish Community High School, Atlanta, Georgia).31

This focus on “all” people and patrons can be understood to include all types of people and all ages. This means addressing the needs of LGBTQ people, who as discussed above, based on demographic studies are highly likely to be present. It also means providing resources that address the lifespan from children to adults and their individual needs as they interact with Jewish culture, learning to create informed and engaged Jewish lives. The annotated bibliography that we have created speaks to these needs. Synagogue libraries and denominationally-affiliated day schools are likely to prioritize their own community’s views. However, we believe that based on Jewish values such as be-tselem Elohim and pikuaḥ nefesh, these libraries need also to present an alternative view, though they may categorize it as incorrect.

FORMATIVE FACTORS FOR THIS BIBLIOGRAPHY

A few points about the bibliography need to be made. There are many classic secular LGBTQ-related books that would be appropriate in Jewish libraries and that can be identified from sites such as the ALA’s GLBTRT page. Our bibliography is only focused on Jewish LGBTQ books, and even within this limitation, there were many fine and worthy anthologies, memoirs, and literary and textual critiques that were not included. Being mindful of the economic realities of libraries today, we tried to create as short but essential a list as possible. The only exception to the LGBTQ Jewish-only criteria is in the area of children’s literature, which offers an extreme dearth of choices.

Addressing LGBTQ topics for very young children is especially sensitive and no matter how it is done, it is never possible to please every patron. It is important to remember that, as educators, we don’t talk to young children about heterosexual sex, so why would there would be a desire or an assumption to talk about sex between two people of the same gender? LGBTQ-related

books for young children are focused on family diversity, love, and acceptance of differences. It was only very recently, that the first Jewish and LGBTQ books for children in English were published. One of them, The Purim Superhero 2013, was also at the center of a controversy in 2014. The PJ Library, self-defined as a “Jewish Family Engagement program” and funded by a family foundation and other local philanthropic partners, mails free books with Jewish content to families in North America with children aged six months to eight years. In 2014, they chose The Purim Superhero as a supplemental book, rather than as the regular holiday selection. Concerned with offending members who were more traditional, the PJ Library announced that it would supply the book only to parents who requested it. The Purim Superhero was a “lovely book,” they explained, that “reflects the diversity of our community” and “captures the excitement of preparing for Purim and teaches important messages of the holiday.” However, given their “one size fits all” gift model, they were putting “parents in the driver’s seat” (Sandler Grinspoon 2014). This new option taken for a book with an LGBT-related feature provoked many passionate responses. Naomi Sunshine (2014) wrote:

The message that you send to families like mine (and there are lots of Jewish LGBT people and families) is that we are second class. That families like ours should only be read about by children whose parents go to the great lengths of finding out that you are offering the book and then ordering it. That our lives are so marginal that you could not possibly send a book that features a family like ours to everybody, because further marginalizing LGBT families is a lesser evil than offending homophobes.

On the Jewish Philanthropy website, Victoria L. Steinberg wrote that while she was a fan of the PJ Library, she didn’t equally love all their books since some were too traditional for her family, portraying strongly gender-divided roles that did not reflect her and her husband’s egalitarian values for their daughters. When such a book would come, she would make a choice not to read it and would pass it on to others who would enjoy it. Her observation reinforced the appearance of PJL being worried about potentially offending their traditional patrons by sending out The Purim Superhero, but seeming not to worry about offending their liberal patrons when books were sent that depicted a more traditionally-based view of Judaism. Steinberg pointed out that,

Requiring people to opt-in to receive The Purim Superhero inappropriately layers onto that mission a “controversy” litmus test . . . History unfortunately proves that when this litmus test is applied to books, we exclude books we later realize we needed most. At a given time, the most controversial books concern the most marginalized, unpopular viewpoint or group. Excluding them perpetuates that marginalization. (Steinberg 2014)

PJ Library reported that their entire stock of 2,200 copies of The Purim Superhero was requested within thirty-six hours, so they ordered more to be delivered after Purim (Tziperman Lotan 2014).
While the first Jewish and LGBTQ books for children in English were just recently published, there have been Israeli Hebrew-language children’s books that include families with same-gender parents for several years. These books do not include a Jewish religious aspect, but because they are in Hebrew and can be used in day schools, Hebrew schools and Sunday schools, we have included three of them. Because of both the significant need to address inclusion and family diversity in early childhood education and the relative lack of Jewish LGBTQ books, we included some of the best secular LGBTQ children’s books, even though they are not specifically Jewish. This genre is now in its second and third generation, having moved from the LGBTQ content being in the foreground, as in Heather Has Two Mommies (not included in the list),\(^\text{32}\) to using animals to stand in for LGBTQ people, to stories where there are characters who may be LGBTQ but this aspect is not the main focus of the story.

While LGBTQ fiction and the Young Adult genre have exploded in recent years, we found a severe lack of options for LGBTQ Jewish books for teenagers. In creating a section for day school, synagogue, and center libraries, we included a number of adult nonfiction titles that teenagers could read, but there were almost no LGBTQ-related Young Adult fiction for teenagers. There were two books that we considered but ultimately rejected for our essential books list. Parrotfish (Wittlinger 2007), which takes its name from a fish that can change its gender, is an engaging Young Adult book about Angela Katz-McNair, a high school junior who transitions to become Grady Katz-McNair. Grady shares the unexpected trials as well as the excitement, such as a first kiss, that such a journey entails. The book is sometimes included on Jewish LGBTQ lists, probably because Grady’s mother is Jewish, but our only clues are passing references and that the three siblings’ last name includes Katz, their mother’s last name. While the author includes many aspects of diversity and difference such as being biracial, being bullied, and single motherhood, in addition to the gender identity theme, the book does not explore Jewishness or interfaith family issues in any meaningful way. The children celebrate Christmas and never think about their Jewish heritage aside from stating that their mother is Jewish. The younger son says that he “forgets” that his mother is Jewish, and the mother, despite not liking that she lives in the “Christmas house”, never says anything about her discomfort to her Christmas-obsessed husband.

Parrotfish is a well-described portrayal of a teenager who transitions while experiencing the difficulties of high school and finding friends and allies in unlikely places. However, it would need significant curricular guidance to be used in a Jewish context to develop a meaningful dialogue about the interfaith aspect and to connect that to the transgender narrative. Some educators may want to attempt this given the rarity of a Young Adult book about a transgender teen that even mentions Judaism. Given the reasons described, while we can appreciate its merits for the LGBT market, we have not included it in our essential LGBT Jewish book lists for day school, synagogue, and center libraries.

The other book we considered, but did not include, is *The Wonderful Adventures of Benjamin and Solomon*, written by Elena Yakubsfeld (Dodi Press, 2013). It is an odd mash-up of fantasy fiction and Judaism that cannot seem to decide what it wants to be with aspects of Sholem Aleichem as well as fairy stories. The author’s protagonists are two young yeshivah students that are a couple. Unfortunately, their development as a couple comes across awkwardly as they simply repeat several times how much they really like each other. The book reads like Hasidic slash fiction\(^{33}\) that takes *Yentl* one step further but for a tween population, so there is no sex involved. To the best of our knowledge, this is the first Young Adult book to include gay content in a strongly Jewish setting. For this reason, we have described it here but did not include it in the list of essential LGBTQ Jewish books for libraries, as while it may be the first of its kind, it is not an exemplar of its unique genre.

In contrast to the early childhood education section, in which we included secular LGBTQ materials, we omitted secular items in the Young Adult section because so many other resources for LGBTQ teens already exist that librarians can access. As this article was going to press, we were made aware of some forthcoming (Summer 2014) Young Adult books which reportedly include Jewish and LGBTQ themes, but we were not able to obtain them for review purposes for this article. As discussed above, just because a book brings up some aspects of Judaism and LGBTQ identity, does not mean that it should become an essential part of a Jewish library collection. With shrinking resources and limited shelf space, libraries and patrons need the best examples of literature that reflects who they are and makes them think about those unique aspects.

Two areas proved to be beyond the scope of this bibliography: films and adult fiction. When reviewing nonfiction, it was usually evident whether the work had Jewish content as well as some combination of LGBTQ content. Films and fiction offered different challenges. Though we began reviewing LGBTQ films, we determined that they needed their own article in order to adequately discuss the complexities of what makes a film Jewish and LGBTQ in an authentic way. Is it the content, the author, the national origin (e.g. Israeli), the sensibility, or some elusive combination of all of these aspects? Nevertheless, there were a few exceptional films that we felt confident recommending as a starting place for digital media collections.

Similarly, as the authors began to collect and review LGBTQ Jewish adult fiction, some of the questions that were raised regarding films also applied to fiction. The criteria for nonfiction were clear in most cases: does the content focus on a Jewish and LGBTQ theme? In considering fiction, the criteria became more complicated. If an author is gay and Jewish, for example, but there is only limited or no LGBTQ Jewish content in the book, does that disqualify it from consideration for the list? What if there is a character who happens to be LGBTQ and Jewish, but they only have a small role and there may or may not be any manifestation of their queer and Jewish identity? Given the rapid growth of LGBTQ fiction for adults, we are familiar with many books

---

\(^{33}\) Slash fiction is a subcategory of fan fiction, where authors change straight male characters from books or television shows into gay characters in relationships with each other, and publish their work on the Internet.
that include combinations of LGBTQ Jewish characters, subject matter and authors. Given our capacity at this time, the number of books to review and the complexity of the selection factors, we limited the scope of this bibliography, but hope to address adult LGBTQ fiction at another time. The bibliography we developed is only the start of what we hope will be a longer conversation.

**How is this Bibliography Different from all Other Bibliographies?**

Taking into account the many political, cultural, and religious considerations, and the diversity of library settings and missions, what are essential books on LGBTQ Jewish topics that a Jewish library or a Judaica collection should offer? To create the following lists, the authors relied on their professional experience as a librarian and an academic, respectively in the area of Judaism and LGBTQ issues for over twenty-five combined years, as well as on earlier bibliographies, and on suggestions received following Facebook posts soliciting the essential Jewish LGBT books needed in a Jewish library. The authors acknowledge our biases. The choices that we have made are based on a liberal, LGBTQ-positive framework, which we see as supported by Jewish ideals and values as well as by national, secular, library values. We recognize that not every reader will share our perspective and know that some rabbis and librarians from traditional institutions who look at this bibliography may think that they could never acquire and display these books. For the value of pikuah nefesh alone, we would urge them to buy two books that at first seemed unthinkable and to share them with their community through the library. A rabbinic colleague of the authors likes to say, “We don’t have a Jew to lose,” which is backed up by the Pew study, *A Portrait of Jewish Americans* (Pew Research Center’s Religion & Public Life Project 2013). By including material that is at a minimum tolerant and not hostile, there is the chance to keep people who are LGBTQ and Orthodox, their parents, and their families connected to Judaism. For the majority of Jewish libraries, we believe that our list is an essential starting point to begin or continue their LGBTQ collections.

As Jacobs (2006) writes, “No one answer can meet the needs of every Jew: the more voices we represent, the more likely it is that the next Jewish youth or adult to come into our libraries searching will find affirmation.” The annotated bibliography we created begins with a core collection for all libraries, followed by additional entries to supplement the mission of academic and research libraries; the final category is day school, synagogue, and community libraries. For each book that is listed, there were often five or more others that were considered. Should the first book in its genre be included for historical reasons even if a more current overview is offered in a newer publication? If there are two similar books that represent a particular content area, how can they be qualitatively differentiated? Our review process encompassed dozens of books and

---

34 On August 26, 2013, Joel Kushner posted a request for recommendations on essential LGBT Jewish books on his Facebook page and the Facebook page of the Institute for Judaism and Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity. Thirty-one people responded with individual and multiple suggestions, including the Jewish Book Council’s Gay Jewish Reading list by author Warren Hoffman (August 31, 2011) and a Jewish GLBT Reading List curated by Kesher (January 20, 2011). The responders included rabbis from various denominations, academics, LGBTQ activists, and everyday Jews and non-Jews.
many long discussions and entailed difficult choices. Especially for the academic and research libraries, there are many more books that could have been named, but we were attempting to focus on a core group of essential books that we could agree on. We also know that for all of the sections, we were trying to quantify a moving target. In reality, even as we knew that this bibliography is and must become a dynamic, ever-evolving list as new books emerge and deserve to be added to it. Ultimately, we chose to create a snapshot at this particular time. We welcome the prospect of discussion of these choices, as it can only enhance the process of LGBTQ Jewish collection development and collaboration for Jewish libraries and their patrons. While this is not the first, only, or last bibliography of Jewish LGBTQ materials, it is the authors’ hope that at this time, it will be valuable because of its inclusiveness, annotations, focus, and currency.

**Annotated Bibliography**

**Essential Resources: A Core Book Collection for Jewish Libraries**


Written from a Reform point of view but applicable to a range of denominations, this volume is a valuable resource for any synagogue or school. In addition to personal stories, it offers suggestions for becoming a welcoming LGBT congregation, lesson plans for school programs, life cycle ceremonies, extensive curriculums, and the texts of Reform resolutions on LGBT issues. (Disclosure: one of the authors of this article was an editor of *Kulanu*.)


Dr. Alpert, a Reconstructionist rabbi, examines the Torah texts concerned with sexuality and personal relationships—first from a traditional standpoint and then from a lesbian/feminist academic point of view. She continues with a discussion of how lesbian relationships can exemplify Jewish values.


This deeply personal collection of essays highlights the tension between being true to oneself and conforming to the community’s expectations. Since the women represent a wide range of ages and denominational affiliation, they experienced “coming out” in very different environments. A common thread that runs through the essays is that being open and honest about one’s personal life makes professional work more effective.

This collection of commentaries continues the centuries-old practice of reading the Torah with new eyes. The commentators here examine the texts from a queer (lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, gender-nonconforming) perspective, including each week’s *parashah* as well as major Jewish holidays. The book has a foreword by Judith Plaskow.


The first of its kind, this book is divided into three sections. It both focuses on personal narratives of transgender people who connect to Jewish life and ritual and examines Jewish texts. The contributors provide a deep range of experience and knowledge on the topic, resulting in chapters ranging from subjects that cover gender diversity in ancient Judaism (*androgynous*, *ṭumṭum*, *aylonit*) and what we would now call people with intersex conditions to modern reflections of transgender Jewish identity.


Rabbi Greenberg, an out Orthodox rabbi, closely examines the two verses from the Torah that explicitly mention homosexual behavior (Leviticus 18 and 20.). He continues with biblical examples of male relationships, legal discussions in the *Shulhan 'Arukh* and Responsa literature, and sample medieval homoerotic Jewish poetry. He discusses four of the rationales often cited in anti-gay literature: reproduction, social disruption, category confusion, and humiliation and violence, and concludes with a chapter on what inclusion would look like in an Orthodox setting.


Traditional LBT Jewish women have often felt doubly ostracized, as they are criticized in the secular LGBTQ community because of their religiosity and disparaged in the religious community because of their sexuality. This collection of personal essays describes the struggle to find a home and a community.


This intensely personal memoir traces the journey Ladin takes from “Jay” to “Joy.” Ladin
was a married English professor and poet at Yeshiva University, an Orthodox institution, when he realized that he could no longer continue living as a man and began the transition process to female. Ladin describes the effect this had on her life, family and work.


Written by a polymath scholar and prolific author, Michaelson examines verses from both the Hebrew and Christian scriptures that refer to homosexuality, sexuality, and relationships. He concludes that the Hebrew Bible does not forbid gay relationships, rather encourages any loving relationship. The volume includes academic scholarship but is also aimed at a general reader who might encounter the book in an adult education class, book club, or library.


This collection of queer poems and short stories is divided into three sections: contemporary midrashim of selected portions of the Tanakh, writings inspired by the homoerotic poetry of medieval Spain, and contemporary scenes of daily life arranged according to the order of the prayer services. The book has a foreword by Jay Michaelson and includes an afterword by Camille Shira Angel and Dev Noily.


This is the first modern book written from a traditional Orthodox point of view on this topic. Rabbi Rapoport acknowledges the fact that some people are hard-wired to have same-sex attractions, at the same time affirming the classical Orthodox position that homosexual behavior is forbidden. He acknowledges the struggle that many gays and lesbians experience and encourages them to participate in the Jewish community as much as they are able. The book includes a foreword by Rabbi Jonathan Sacks and a preface by Dayan Berkovits.


There are several strong anthologies of this genre, but this one does an excellent job combining scholarly essays with personal narratives. The contributors discuss issues of identity and how LGBT Jews are finding their place in Jewish practice, institutions, and cultures.

This siddur enriches the traditional liturgy with alternative prayers and interpretations that acknowledge the diverse LGBTQIQ Jewish community. It contains suggestions for themed Shabbat services such as a Pride Shabbat and inclusive prayers written from an LGBTQIQ lens.

**Research and Academic Libraries (in addition to the Core Collection List)**


The essays in this collection explore the relationships between Jewishness and queerness, between homophobia and anti-Semitism, and between queer theory and notions of Jewishness. The book examines how this dual-otherness manifests itself in literature, theater, and society.


What is a family, how are families created, and how do they function? What about marriage and monogamy? Densely written using her own personal story as well as academic theory, Brettschneider examines these issues through the lenses of race, class, religion, feminism, and queer theory.


This book manifests the complexity and challenges that sometimes occur in determining which factors make a book appropriate for Jewish and LGBT resource lists. This book comfortably fits in Gender Studies, exploring bisexuality using feminist, bi, genderqueer, political and radical activist lenses. In addition, the author is Israeli and includes the history and development of the bisexual movement in Israel, which has never before been documented in a published English format. She also develops an interesting extended comparison between the racialization and oppression of Mizrahis in Israel and Mizrahniness with the treatment of bisexuals. Then, she explores the similarities and intersections between the two concepts. This book will likely also be controversial because of its political bent. The author, who locates herself in Israel/Occupied Palestine, declares herself to be in solidarity with the Palestinians and understands Israel as a colonial and oppressive force. This viewpoint is actively present in much of her writing. Some of her claims sound far-fetched and should have been documented with references to sustain them. Yet the fact that similar practices between majority and minority populations have
occurred in the United States and other nations leaves open the door to their occurrence in Israel. Despite some flaws, Eisner’s writing is generally scholarly and she is insightful in her discussion of bisexuality and in creating a new lens through which to understand bisexuality in the Israeli context. She has expanded and enriched the field and for these reasons, we have included this volume in the research and academic section of the list.


Co-founder of Jews Offering New Alternatives for Healing (JONAH), Goldberg believes that through conversion or “reparative” therapy, he can change a person’s sexual orientation. While this type of therapy has been discredited and disavowed by all major medical and psychological associations in the United States, the book explains a longstanding stream of thought on the nature and “treatment” of homosexuality that still appeals to some communities.


From the Hebrew Bible to the Internet, this collection discusses aspects of both heterosexual and LGBTQ sexual relationships. Essays include Biblical commentaries responding to “Bible-thumping homophobia”, inclusion in the liturgy, wedding ceremonies, and several chapters on LGBTQ issues in the Reform movement. While the subtitle of the book refers to “sexuality”, this volume covers topics of many other aspects of intimate relationships, including infidelity, family purity, divorce, sexuality education, infertility, breast-feeding, menopause, sex and aging, and pornography and sex trafficking. Each section also includes some personal reflections. Although most of the contributors write from a Reform Jewish perspective, this collection is an essential reference guide for any Jewish library.


This essay collection proposes that while the play *Angels in America* brought issues of queer and Jewish culture together in a dramatic way, the two have been intertwined in America for the past hundred years. The essays examine queer themes in Yiddish theater and Jewish American literature.
The Torah often contains seemingly contradictory passages. In this book, though Jennings does not ignore the passages in Leviticus, he focuses on same-sex relationships and sexuality.

The essays in this collection reflect a wide range of religious beliefs and practices. Although it does not focus exclusively on Judaism, there are contributions by Jews, and this elusive combination of bisexuality and Judaism merits its inclusion in this list.

Although a little dated (the essays are based on oral histories from 1988–1989), this groundbreaking collection offers an important snapshot of lesbian life at the time it was beginning to thrive in Israel.

An Israeli ethnographer, Shokeid examines the formation, growth, and running of Congregation Beth Simchat Torah, the largest gay and lesbian congregation in the United States. He examines the complexities of being a community of “outsiders.”

**DAY SCHOOL, SYNAGOGUE AND CENTER LIBRARIES**

**Preschool and Elementary School**


Told in easy rhyme with vivid, full-page illustrations, this short story shows the many different forms that families can take.

The rhymes in this simple book for young children present many different family constellations, including a two-dad family that gives the book its title and cover illustration. On the last page, a child can add what his/her family looks like.


Jonathan is excited when his two Jewish mothers tell him that he can adopt a puppy for his eighth birthday, and he ultimately chooses a Hebrew name for the dog. The book focuses more on adoption issues; the fact of having two mothers who are shown in a positive light is taken for granted.


This first Jewish children’s LGBT book in the United States was the result of a national contest created by Keshet. The author’s submission became the winning entry and was published by Kar-Ben. In the book, Nate, an elementary school-age boy who happens to have an Abba and a Daddy, has trouble deciding on a Purim costume at Hebrew school because of peer pressure. With some help from his parents, he learns about Purim, being independent, and making his own decisions.

Shir, Semadar, and Ronit Golik. *Kol tsiv’e ha-ḳeshet; All the Rainbow Colours*. Tel Aviv: Yediʻot aḥaronot: Sifre Ḥemed, 2010. [Hebrew]

This collection of short stories features families that have been formed in many ways, including in-vitro fertilization, fostering, and by two-father and two-mother families.

**SUPPLEMENTAL SECULAR LGBT BOOKS FOR EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION**


One of Noah’s two mothers invents a bedtime story for him about Noah and a dragon that no longer wanted to be so fierce. This story includes both a same-sex couple and a lesson about being one’s own self.


The queen wants to retire, so the prince must marry. He is having a hard time finding a
bride among the princesses, but then he finally meets one of their brothers. The authors have cleverly reshaped a traditional fairy tale with humor and joy.


Through the eyes of the young child, these two board books show a typical day with same-sex parents. Although not Jewish, the books’ cute depictions of non-typical families will be enjoyed by the very young.


Based on a true story, two male penguins at the Central Park Zoo bond, and when a zookeeper finds an abandoned egg, he gives it to the pair. They keep it warm until it hatches and then together take care of the penguin chick. This is a sweet story of an atypical family.

**Adult Selections (many would also be appropriate for older teenagers)**


Gad Beck, who was the child of a Jewish father and Christian mother, survived the war after spending time in the underground and in German prisons. In this book, he chronicles his everyday life in Nazi Germany and describes the fate of other family members and friends who were imprisoned and tortured because they were Jewish, gay, or both.


Fifty years after the death of Felice Schragenheim (Jaguar), Elisabeth Wust (Aimée) tells the story of their love affair to the author. In the early 1940s, Wust was a mother of four children who was married to a Nazi officer. After many affairs with both men and women, she met and fell in love with Schragenheim, a member of the underground. Only after the affair began did Schragenheim tell Wust that she was Jewish. Their story is told through interviews and letters.

This detailed biography of Barney Frank traces his career from college to the House of Representatives. It examines Frank’s Jewish identity and his coming out process both personally and professionally. Weisberg also discusses the sex scandal that Frank had been involved with and the honest, direct way Frank had dealt with it.


Weddings are well known for bringing to the surface all kinds of family tensions. Told as a four-way conversation, this volume chronicles the engagement and wedding of Douglas and Andrew from their point of view as well as from that of Andrew’s parents, Roslyn and Sheldon. Set in a Canadian Jewish community, it highlights how even a comfortably “out” gay man still had to deal with a public “coming out” during the wedding planning process and how loving, supportive parents discovered that they still had some lingering homophobia to confront.

**Films**


*Trembling before G-d* follows the lives of several gay and lesbian Orthodox Jews and interviews rabbis and psychologists about homosexuality and Orthodox Judaism. The film creates a poignant snapshot of the Jews’ lives. Rabbi Steven Greenberg, the most openly gay Orthodox rabbi, is one of the interviewees. In 2005, the director released a forty-minute follow-up, the travelogue *Trembling on the Road*, which chronicles changes that occurred after the original documentary premiered. This featurette is included as additional material on the 2009 two-disc edition of *Trembling before G-d*. While *Trembling before G-d* is often painful and difficult to watch, *Trembling on the Road* is more celebratory and uplifting, as it shows how the original film changed peoples’ lives.

Epstein, Robert P., Jeffrey Friedman, Klaus Müller, Michael Ehrenzweig, Janet Cole, Rupert Everett, Tibor Szemző, and Dawn Logsdon. *Paragraph 175*. [United States]: New Yorker Video, 2002. (81 minutes)

This documentary shares the stories of several gay men and one lesbian who were arrested by the Nazis under Paragraph 175, the sodomy provision of the German penal code. From 1933 to 1945, 100,000 men were arrested, blackmailed, and sent to jail and concentration camps. Of these 100,000, only 4,000 survived. In 2000, less than ten were
known to be alive. One of them, Gad Beck, was Jewish and spent the war both as part of the resistance and in prison. As an additional resource, the diary of Gad Beck’s lover, Manfred Lewin, who did not survive the war, is an online artifact as part of the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum exhibit, Do You Remember: When, at http://www.ushmm.org/information/exhibitions/online-features/collections-highlights/do-you-remember-when. Annette Eick, one of the few Jewish lesbians ever to be documented from this period, describes her life and how she escaped to England during the war.


Directed by one of Israel’s most successful filmmakers, this feature film tells the story of Yossi (Ohad Knoller) who commands a company of soldiers near Lebanon. In secret, he develops a romantic relationship with his second-in-command, Li’or, who is nicknamed Jagger (Yehuda Levi). Jagger is ultimately fatally injured in a nighttime ambush and dies in the arms of his lover, who is only then able to articulate his full love for Jagger. In the final scene, Yossi attends shiv’ah at Jagger’s parents’ house, but cannot share who he is and what he shared with Jagger.


This documentary tells the story of Shulamit Izen, a ninth grader who wants to create a gay–straight alliance at her pluralistic Jewish high school in the Boston area. Her campaign is transformative for everyone involved and addresses both the struggle to create a supportive environment for gay and lesbian students and teachers and that community that wrestles with definitions of pluralism and diversity in a Jewish context.


Traditional and proper Noemi (Ania Bukstein) loves to study Torah with her rabbi father and does not want to marry the man picked out for her. She persuades him to allow her to attend an Orthodox yeshivah for girls in Safed. There she meets her roommate Michel (Michal Shtamler), a free spirit, and begins to fall in love with her. The two girls are assigned to help the mysterious foreigner Anouk (Fanny Ardant), who has a tortured past and craves forgiveness while fighting cancer. The girls try to help her with a secret Kabbalistic ritual and are ultimately expelled for the choices they make. This complex, multilayered film is well acted. It looks at a world where there are no easy answers and life does not always offer a happy ending.
This film combines themes of the Holocaust, lesbianism, and Jewish identity. Based on the true events of the book by the same name, by Erica Fischer (see above), this film explores the lives of Felice Schragenheim (Maria Schrader), code-named Jaguar, a Jewish woman who is part of the underground, and Lilly Wust (Juliane Köhler), code-named Aimée, a mother of four children who is married to a Nazi officer. In 1943, Aimée and Jaguar begin a relationship and eventually Jaguar reveals that she is Jewish. She is ultimately captured by the Gestapo and sent to the Theresienstadt concentration camp.

**Sources**


